

Manitoba Public Insurance
2014/15 General Rate Application

A Review of Road Safety Programs of
Manitoba Public Insurance and
International Good Practice

Mavis Johnson
Canadian Traffic Safety Institute
8553 Flowering Place
Burnaby, B.C., V5A 4B4

September 11, 2013

Table of Contents

Executive summary.....	4
Chapter 1 – Introduction.....	4
Chapter 2 - Road safety management.....	5
Chapter 3 – The role of Insurance Companies in road safety.....	5
Chapter 4 - MPI's road safety programs.....	5
Chapter 5 - Summary of conclusions and recommendations.....	6
Chapter 1 - Introduction	6
Background.....	6
Structure of report.....	8
Collision experience.....	8
Collision patterns and trends.....	9
Comparison with other provinces.....	13
Manitoba Public Insurance Public Consultation.....	14
Chapter 2 – An overview of good practice programs.....	16
2.1 The Safe System Approach.....	16
What is the Safe System Approach?.....	16
2.2 Results Focus.....	17
2.3 Implementation arrangements (institutional arrangements and management and coordination framework).....	18
2.3.1 A framework for review of performance.....	19
2.3.2 Identifying a lead agency.....	19
2.3.3 Developing an effective strategy with robust targets.....	20
2.3.4 Effective multi-sectoral coordination and management.....	21
2.3.5 Appropriate Legislative framework.....	22
2.3.6 Strategic linkages between countermeasure programs and agencies.....	22
Proven Road User Initiatives.....	23
2.3.7 Funding.....	23
Typical Advantages and Disadvantages of Different Sources of Financing for Road Safety	24
2.3.8 Road safety advocacy, promotion and publicity.....	24
2.3.9 Monitoring and evaluation.....	25
Chapter 3 – The role of Auto Insurance companies in road safety	26
Chapter 4 – Review of MPI Road Safety Programs.....	30
4.1 General Overview.....	30

4.2 Driver Education.....	33
Program evaluation.....	34
Northport Associates MPI HSDE program Formative Evaluative Project.....	35
Northport Associates Large Scale Evaluation of Driver Education (Summative).....	36
4.3 Graduated Driver Licensing	37
4.4 Occupant restraints.....	38
4.4.1 Seat belts.....	38
4.4.2 Child passenger safety.....	39
4.5 Speeding.....	40
4.6 Impaired driving.....	43
4.6.1 Drinking/driving.....	43
4.6.2 Distracted driving.....	45
4.6.2 Driver fatigue.....	46
4.7 Community Relations/Grants.....	46
4.8 Road safety advertising.....	47
4.9 Friends for Life Speaker Series.....	49
4.10 Planned Programs and initiatives for 2013/2014.....	49
4.11 Monitoring and evaluation of road safety programs.....	50
4.12 Summary of MPI Road Safety Programs.....	51
4.13 Additional Road Safety Program for consideration.....	52
Chapter 5 – Conclusions.....	52
Appendix A - Average Collision Cost Values	54
Appendix B - Manitoba’s Graduated Driver License.....	56
Appendix C – Commentary on the July 2011 TIRF Evaluation.....	60
Appendix D – Drinking and Driving Programs.....	62
Appendix E – Additional Programs Funded by MPI.....	64
Appendix F – Developing Alberta’s Aboriginal Traffic Safety Strategy.....	72

Executive summary

In June 2013 Manitoba Public Insurance applied for approval for its 2014/2015 rates from the Manitoba Public Utilities Board.

Under the *Manitoba Public Insurance Corporation Act*, the Corporation has the powers and capacity to:

- Carry out either alone or jointly with other board, commission, corporation, department or agency of government, or any private person, agency, or association, introduce, establish, supervise, finance and promote research or educational programs relating to health, rehabilitation, safety and the reduction of risk in respect of any branch or class of insurance in which the corporation is engaged; and
- Promote or carry out programs of research into the causes of accidents and research into the more equitable distribution of losses resulting from highway traffic accidents.

Recognizing that the jurisdiction of the Manitoba Public Utilities Board relating to road safety is focused on the question of *whether the proposed expenditures of the Corporation are prudent and reasonable*,¹ this report has been prepared on behalf of the Consumers' Association of Canada (Manitoba Branch).

Pursuant to my retainer, the purpose of this report is to:

- Outline national and international good practice when it comes to the development and evaluation of cost effective road safety programs;
- Review the existing road safety and auto crime programs undertaken by MPI with a view to its cost effectiveness;
- Review the existing approach to evaluating road safety and auto crime programs at MPI at both the program and portfolio level with a view to its consistency with cost effective good practice; and
- Review the effectiveness by which MPI integrates its existing programs at both the program and portfolio level with the program of other stakeholders.

The report is structured as follows:

Chapter 1 – Introduction

This includes some background information as to the 2014 Rate Application process, a historical review of traffic collision data for the past ten years (with a key focus on 2011 data), and a comparison of traffic collision data with the other provinces and territories.

Fatal, Injury and Property Damage Collisions by Total Licensed Drivers for 2001-2011 are presented. This chapter also includes collision patterns and trends that are relevant to this report, including the age of drivers (young drivers being over-represented in collisions), the numbers of licensed drivers and vehicles registered and the primary contributing factors to collisions.

Two notable conclusions from this review are:

¹ Terms such as “just and reasonable” or “prudent and necessary” are also employed in rate regulation.

- Collision counts of different severities all increased in 2011 compared to most historical figures.
- When compared with other provinces and territories, Manitoba remains above the Canadian average when collision rates per population, number of licensed drivers and collision rates per registered vehicles are considered.

In March 2012 MPI produced the results of a province wide consultation process². This concluded that the people of Manitoba are clearly supportive of MPI leading a province wide integrated and strategic road safety plan. Manitoba Public Insurance is indeed at a crossroads!

Chapter 2 - Road safety management

This Chapter provides an overview of good practise road safety management approaches, including the Safe System Approach. The Safe System Approach pioneered in Europe and Australia and now accepted practice for road safety management is based on the premise that as road users are human, crashes are always likely to happen even though there is a continuing focus on prevention. The safe system approach recognizes that there are limits to the capacity of the human body to survive various crash types above certain speeds of impact. The safe system approach aims to minimize the severity of injury and is based on the premise that road users should not die because of system failings. In addition, information is presented on the importance of the overall management of road safety, including the institutional management of road safety that addresses issues such as coordination and management and the role of the lead agency, performance evaluation and advocacy, promotion and advertising.

Chapter 3 – The role of Insurance Companies in road safety

This Chapter presents information on the role of auto insurance companies in road safety. It particularly provides some historical information about the progress of the Transport Accident Commission (TAC) in Victoria, Australia which is seen as a world leader in road safety with its' partners VicRoads and VicPolice in the State of Victoria, Australia. In addition information is presented from the US and Canadian Auto Insurance companies.

Chapter 4 - MPI's road safety programs

This includes a brief overview of MPI's road safety initiatives. In Chapter 4 (and the Appendices) you will find a discussion of MPI's goals, strategies and its areas of focus.

MPI's investment in road safety for 2012/2013 is \$11,587,000 – which represents about 1.4% of basic insurance costs. The forecast for 2013/2014 is only slightly higher. MPI partners with a variety of government and non-government partners to implement their programs.

Several weaknesses have been identified which need to be addressed.

- The whole road safety program is not strategic in nature in that the programs (and partners) lack coordination.

² Safer Roads – Saving Lives and Preventing Injuries – Results of Public Consultation March 2012.

- There is very little evidence of any ongoing monitoring and evaluation of these programs to ensure they are being cost effective.
- While the legislative components of most of the programs are comparable with other provinces and territories, it is not clear whether there are aggressive and focused enforcement to support them, which may make them fall short of good practice.
- Many of the programs are supported by quality information brochures and guidelines on the MPI website but, while this might provide information it is probably not enough to create sustained behaviour change.

The plans for road safety programs for 2013/2014 include funding for many programs and road safety sponsorships. In reality, there are probably too many and because the program resources are minimal, they will probably have very little impact on traffic collisions.

The importance of monitoring and evaluation cannot be overstated. The only way MPI can continue to ensure that their resources are used strategically and effectively is to continue to monitor them.

Chapter 5 - Summary of conclusions and recommendations

A more strategic and integrated approach is required if there is a keen desire for change. There needs to be a breaking down of the “silos” as government and non-government agencies together with municipal governments, businesses and the public work together in a spirit of coordination and collaboration under the auspices of a lead agency. In fact Manitobans have already spoken about their support for MPI to take on this leadership role.

Throughout this document, recommendations are made that address; a strategic approach to road safety; the importance of having a vision, targets and performance measures to ensure that sustained progress is made; targeted advertising and the importance of evaluating campaigns and indeed for the campaigns to be focused on enforceable actions.

Please note that this report does not constitute a formal review³ (evaluation) of MPI’s road safety programs (due to time limitations). It merely reflects the views of the author based on reading many research documents and papers related to MPI’s programs.

Chapter 1 - Introduction

Background

In June 2013 Manitoba Public Insurance applied for approval for its 2014/2015 rates from the Manitoba Public Utilities Board.

Under the *Manitoba Public Insurance Corporation Act*, the Corporation has the powers and capacity to:

3 A more formal review would be far more robust – examining each programs’ outputs and outcomes. It would look at the “how much”, “how many” and “who” and include a great more detail on the other partner/stakeholders’ activities.

- Carry out either alone or jointly with other board, commission, corporation, department or agency of government, or any private person, agency, or association, introduce, establish, supervise, finance and promote research or educational programs relating to health, rehabilitation, safety and the reduction of risk in respect of any branch or class of insurance in which the corporation is engaged; and
- Promote or carry out programs of research into the causes of accidents and research into the more equitable distribution of losses resulting from highway traffic accidents.

Recognizing that the jurisdiction of the Manitoba Public Utilities Board relating to road safety is focused on the question of *whether the proposed expenditures of the Corporation are prudent and reasonable*,⁴ this report has been prepared on behalf of the Consumers' Association of Canada (Manitoba Branch).

The purpose of this report is to:

- Outline national and international good practice when it comes to the development and evaluation of cost effective road safety programs;
- Review the existing road safety and auto crime programs undertaken by MPI with a view to its cost effectiveness;
- Review the existing approach to evaluating road safety and auto crime programs at MPI at both the program and portfolio level with a view to its consistency with cost effective good practice; and
- Review the effectiveness by which MPI integrates its existing programs at both the program and portfolio level with the program of other stakeholders.

In preparing this report, the following documents have been reviewed:

Activity	Sources of information
Review road safety and auto-crime programs undertaken by MPI for past 5 years	1.Strategic plans 2.Annual reports 3.Program overviews 4.Program monitoring and evaluation plans 5.Any published papers, conference proceedings that provide program overviews
Review road safety and auto-crime programs undertaken by other Manitoba government departments and other agencies for past 5 years	1.Provincial road safety plans 2.Program reports to Transport Canada/CCMTA/TAC 3.List of partners/agencies in Manitoba involved in road safety/auto crime 4.Any province-wide program monitoring and evaluation plans 5.Any published papers, conference proceedings that provide province-wide program overviews
Review collision data for Manitoba for previous 5 years	1.Annual collision statistics reports

4 Terms such as "just and reasonable" or "prudent and necessary" are also employed in rate regulation.

Review any evaluations/studies on MPI road safety/auto crime programs in past 5 years. Identify limitations of research as presented.	1. Completed program monitoring and evaluation plans
Undertake national and international scan of good practice on similar programs currently undertaken by MPI	Desk top analysis of several reliable sources in Canada, US, UK, Australia

Structure of report

The report is structured as follows:

Chapter 1 provides an introduction, which includes some background information as to the 2014 Rate Application process, a historical review of traffic collision data for the past ten years (with a key focus on 2011 data), and a comparison of traffic collision data with the other provinces and territories.

Chapter 2 provides an overview of good practise road safety management approaches, including the Safe System Approach.

Chapter 3 presents information on the role of auto insurance companies in road safety.

Chapter 4 reviews many of the road safety programs undertaken through MPI, or in partnership with MPI. Additional discussion of some of the subject matters can be found in Appendices B, C, D, E and F.

Chapter 5 is the summary of conclusions and recommendations.

Collision experience

The *Traffic Collision Statistics Report* is the official report of traffic collision statistics in Manitoba. It reports the details surrounding traffic collisions in Manitoba, allowing users to analyze the reasons why collisions occur. Knowing more about collisions helps policy makers, traffic safety experts, public safety programmers and legislators to pinpoint areas for review and create targeted approaches to preventing and reducing traffic collisions.

Due to amendments to the Highway Traffic Act that took effect in October 2011, this report uses two sources for Traffic Accident Reports (TARs); TARs completed by a law enforcement agency and TARs completed when a collisions claim is registered with Manitoba Public Insurance. This change to the use of two data sources resulted in an increase in collision counts, specifically for collisions resulting in minor or minimal injuries or property damage only.⁵

The following table identifies the Fatal, Injury and Property Damage Collisions by Total Licensed Drivers: 2001-2011

⁵ Traffic Collision Statistics Report 2011.

Table 1

Year	Licensed drivers	Total Collisions	Coll./ 10,000 drivers	Total fatal	Fatal/ 10,000 drivers	Total injury	Injury/ 10,000 driver	Total PDO	PDO/ 10,000 drivers
2001	695,747	30,927	444.5	82	1.2	6,634	95.4	24,211	348.0
2002	700,169	31,909	455.7	99	1.4	6,934	99.0	24,876	355.3
2003	703,889	34,771	494.0	95	1.3	7,273	103.3	27,403	389.3
2004	711,488	35,002	492.0	90	1.3	6,855	96.3	28,057	394.3
2005	716,169	33,164	463.1	88	1.2	6,482	90.5	26,594	371.3
2006	724,330	31,738	438.2	104	1.4	6,503	89.8	25,131	347.0
2007	752,398	29,494	392.0	96	1.3	6,415	85.4	22,983	305.5
2008	765,060	27,092	354.1	85	1.1	5,974	78.4	21,033	274.9
2009	776,209	26,578	342.4	83	1.1	5,396	69.5	21,099	271.8
2010	790,331	27,172	343.8	78	1.0	5,386	68.1	21,708	274.7
2011	813,691	34,302	421.6	94	1.2	6,309	77.5	27,899	342.9

NOTE: Data for 2001 and 2002 use a different methodology when counting the population of licensed drivers than does the data for 2003 through 2011 and is therefore not exactly comparable to the calculations for 2003-2011.

It should be noted that the increases in total collisions in 2011 are mainly due to a change in the reporting requirements, as described in the above paragraph.

Relative to ten years ago, the total number of collisions in 2011 increased by 11% (34,302 in 2011 compared to 30,927 in 2001). While the overall count of collisions increased, the relative involvement (per 10,000 licensed drivers) in collisions decreased by 5% in the same period (421.6 in 2011 compared to 444.5 in 2001).⁶

Collision patterns and trends

Collision counts of different severities all increased in 2011 compared to most historical figures:

- Fatal collisions increased by 15% compared to 2001, by 21% compared to 2010 and by 5% compared to the previous five year (2006-2010) annual average
- Injury collisions decreased by 5% compared to 2001, but have increased by 17% compared to 2010 and by 6% compared to the previous five year (2006-2010) annual average
- PDO collisions increased by 15% compared to 2001, and by nearly 29% compared to 2010 and by 25% compared to the previous five year (2006-2010) annual average
- While not due to the change in reporting structure, there is a substantial increase in the number of fatal collisions in 2011, also with a corresponding increase in the involvement rate.

Recognizing that collision counts could be impacted either positively or negatively by changing population statistics, relative involvement rates per 10,000 licensed drivers are examined to provide a standardized collision rate comparison. This eliminates the effect of

⁶ Traffic Collision Statistics Report 2011 – Table 1-1.

changing population size and focuses on how many drivers are being involved in collisions instead of simply a raw count of collision overall.⁷

Relative involvement⁸ in collisions per 10,000 vehicles registered is another way to view collision rates in a standardized format. It attempts to account for fluctuations in the total number of vehicles registered on Manitoba roadways.

In the 2011 Traffic Collision Statistics Report, MPI reports that the spike in rates for overall collisions, injury collisions and PDO collisions may be partially attributable to the change in reporting requirements as noted above. However, the spike in involvement rate in fatal collisions cannot be attributed to this reporting change.

Canadian Motor Vehicle Collision statistics for Canada from Transport Canada (courtesy of CCMTA) indicate the following:

Table 2

COLLISIONS AND CASUALTIES 2001 – 2010

YEAR	COLLISIONS		VICTIMS		
	FATAL ¹	PERSONAL INJURY ²	FATALITIES ³	SERIOUS INJURIES ⁴	INJURIES (TOTAL) ⁵
2001*	2,413	148,996	2,756	15,285	216,489
2002	2,583	153,859	2,921	15,907	222,707
2003	2,489	150,545	2,779	15,125	216,210
2004	2,436	145,248	2,731	15,591	206,229
2005	2,551	145,603	2,898	15,814	204,764
2006	2,599	142,513 r	2,870 r	15,676 r	199,970 r
2007	2,462 r	138,612 r	2,755 r	14,235 r	192,744 r
2008	2,182	127,648 r	2,434 r	12,722 r	176,455 r
2009	2,011	123,516 r	2,230 r	11,829 r	171,415 r
2010	2,000	123,141	2,227	11,226	170,629

1. "Fatal collisions" include all reported motor vehicle crashes that resulted in at least one death, where death occurred within 30 days of the collision, except in Quebec (eight days).

2. "Personal injury collisions" include all reported motor vehicle crashes which resulted in at least one injury but not death within 30 days of the collision, except in Quebec (eight days).

3. "Fatalities" include all those who died as a result of a reported traffic collision within 30 days of its occurrence, except in Quebec (eight days).

4. "Serious injuries" include persons admitted to hospital for treatment or observation. Serious injuries were estimated from 1991 to 2010 because several jurisdictions under-reported these numbers.

5. "Total injuries" include all reported severity of injuries ranging from minimal to serious.

* Data for Nunavut are not reported for 2001, except for fatalities

r Revised.

7 Traffic Collision Statistics Report 2011: Full comparison charts identifying the percentage change year over year in relative involvement rate (per 10,000 licensed drivers) in fatal, injury and PDO collisions for 2001 to 2011 can be found in the Traffic Collision Statistics Report 2011.

8 The Traffic Collision Statistics Report 2011 defines "**relative involvement**" as a calculation of the numbers of collisions per specific unit of licensed drivers or registered vehicles.

Age of drivers - As age increases, relative involvement in collisions decreases. The youngest drivers in Manitoba continue to have the highest rates of involvement in collisions. In 2011, those aged 16 to 19 have a relative involvement of 914.4, which is:

- 3% higher than those aged 20 to 24
- 31% higher than those aged 25-34
- 50% higher than those aged 35-44
- 68% higher than those aged 45-54
- Twice that of those aged 55-64
- Nearly three times that of those aged 65 and older

The relative collision involvement rate for drivers in the 16-19 year age group increased by almost 19% compared to 2010 and by almost 8% compared to the previous five year annual average.

Licensed drivers – There is an average of 813,691 licensed drivers in Manitoba in 2011, an increase of 3% compared to 2010. Of these:

- 97% are Active drivers, 3% are Suspended drivers
- 52% are Male, 48% are Female
- 70% are between the ages of 25 and 64
- Men account for 73% of all Suspended drivers in Manitoba

There is an average of 63,385 licensed motorcycle drivers in Manitoba in 2011, an increase of 5.5% compared to 2010.

Vehicles registered – There is a total of 866,628 non-commercial vehicles registered in Manitoba in 2011. This is a 2.7% increase over 2010, a 19.7% increase from 2002 and a 7.6% increase over the average registrations for the period 2006-2010.

Collisions on public roadways – most frequently occur:

- In Winnipeg (58% of all collisions, 15% of fatal, 68% of injury and 56% of PDO collisions) and in rural areas (23% of all collisions, 66% of fatal, 19% of injury and 24% of PDO collisions)
- In the winter months (January, February and December) – 33% of all collisions, 20% of fatal, 29% of injury and nearly 34% PDO collisions
- Wednesday through Friday – 48% of all collisions, 47% of fatal, 49% of injury and 48% of PD collisions – with Friday having the highest numbers
- Between the hours of 3pm and 6pm – 24% of all collisions, 12% of fatal, 26% of injury and 23% of PDO collisions
- During “clear” weather conditions (assumed since only 4% of people killed and 3% of seriously injured are identified as “due to (poor) weather conditions”)

Drivers account for more than 69% of all casualties and motor vehicle **passengers** for nearly 23%. **Pedestrians** (4% of all casualties) and **Bicyclists** (more than 2%) are the next largest road user class groups among all casualties. In 2011 **Pedestrians** accounted for 9% of people killed in traffic collisions and **Bicyclists**, .5%. **Motorcyclist/Mopeds** account for more than twice the proportion of people killed as they do for victims overall in 2011.

Motor vehicles colliding with other motor vehicles account for the majority of casualties in Manitoba, both in 2011 and the previous five year (2006-2010) annual average. In 2011, “collision with other motor vehicle” accounts for:

- More than 69% of all casualties
- 39% of people killed, and
- 42% of people seriously injured.

“Collision with fixed object”, “collision with a pedestrian” and “collision with motorcycle” each account for a much higher proportion of people **killed** than of people **injured** in traffic collisions. In 2011, “collision with pedestrian” accounts for twice as many people killed (8% of total killed) as it does people injured (4% of total injured). “Collision with motorcycle” accounts for more than twice as many people **killed** (3% of total killed) as it does people **injured** (1% of total injured). “Collision with fixed object” accounts for nearly twice as many people **killed** (11% of total killed) as it does people **injured** (6% of total injured).

While traffic collisions occurring in **urban locations** account for the majority of casualties overall, traffic collisions in **rural locations** account for the majority of people killed and seriously injured. Traffic collisions in rural locations account for 67% of people killed and 52% of people seriously injured.

In 2011, 39% of the people killed in traffic collisions and 13% of the people seriously injured in traffic collisions are recorded as **not wearing or using the available safety equipment** at the time of the collision.

The most prevalent **contributing factors recorded for collisions** in 2011 include:

- The actions of a wild animal – 14%
- Following too closely – 9%
- Distracted driving – 7%
- Slippery road surface – 6%
- Speed – 5%
- Backing unsafely – 4%
- Fail to yield the right-of-way – 4%
- Lost control/Drive off the road – 3%
- Turning improperly – 3%⁹

The most prevalent contributing factors recorded for collisions where **people are killed or seriously injured** in 2011 include:

- Speed – 34%
- Distracted driving -27%
- Impaired driving – 25%
- Lost control/Drive off the road – 13%
- Slippery road surface – 9%
- Fail to yield the right-of-way – 7%
- Disobey traffic control device/officer – 7%

9 Traffic Collision Statistics Report 2011 – Manitoba Public Insurance.

- Passing improperly – 5%
- Weather conditions – 4%
- Pedestrian error/confusion – 4%
- Leave stop sign before safe to do so – 3%
- The actions of a wild animal – 1%¹⁰

In reviewing the above lists, it is highly recommended that it is the second list which addresses those killed and seriously injured that should be used to identify the key priority topics. In addition to the earlier comments regarding the over-representation of young drivers and the high percentage of drivers who are killed and seriously injured and are not wearing a safety device (seat belt), the key priorities for the Province of Manitoba should be:

- Speed
- Distracted driving
- Impaired driving
- Occupant restraints
- Young drivers
- Rural roads¹¹

Since young drivers are also likely to be those who undertake these risky behaviours it would appear that coordinated campaigns (a combination of enhanced enforcement and targeted public awareness campaigns) should be a key intervention to reduce the frequency and severity of collisions and their subsequent claims costs.¹²

Comparison with other provinces

For a variety of reasons, comparing the provinces' and territories' collision data is not a straightforward task (different reporting benchmarks, lack of police/insurance data, lack of location data, etc.). However Transport Canada over the past twenty years has presented comparison data which helps the provinces and territories to view how they compare with their neighbours. The following data is for 2010.

10 Traffic Collision Statistics Report 2011 – Manitoba Public Insurance.

11 Rural roads have been included as a recommended key priority since 66% of fatalities occur on them.

12 One might wonder why the topic of auto crime is not identified as a key priority. MPI's website reports that over the past several years significant improvements have been made in the area of auto crime. Consequently their investments in this topic are being reduced. In fact, auto crime is a success story.

Table 3¹³

	Per 100,000 Population ¹⁴	Per Billion Vehiclekilometers ¹⁵	Per 100,000 Licensed Drivers		
	Fatalities	Injuries	Fatalities	Injuries	Fatalities
Canada	6.5	500.0	6.6	504.1	9.5
N.L.	5.5	404.1	5.8	426.2	7.7
P.E.I.	6.3	451.9	6.9	493.7	9.1
N.S.	7.4	513.0	6.9	476.9	10.2
N.B.	12.4	458.7	11.5	425.9	16.9
QUE.	6.1	548.6	6.6	594.2	9.4
ONT.	4.3	477.3	4.5	498.3	6.2
MAN.	7.0	570.5	7.2	583.9	11.0
SASK.	16.0	625.9	12.8	499.5	23.1
ALTA.	9.2	490.5	6.6	349.5	12.4
B.C.	8.0	461.5	10.1	579.3	11.6
Y.T.	11.6	636.6	7.9	433.9	15.4
N.W.T.	6.8	257.8	9.4	353.6	12.1
NVT.	6.1	124.9	60.2	1,234.6	48.3

NOTE: Vehicle Kilometres data for 2010 were estimated using average annual growth rates for the previous five years. Data for Ontario are preliminary.

As can be seen from the above chart Manitoba is above the Canadian average.

Manitoba Public Insurance Public Consultation

In March 2012 Manitoba Public Insurance issued a report on a Public Consultation process that had taken place¹⁶. The consultation included the general population, related stakeholder groups and partners and a couple of other external experts, namely the Traffic Injury Research Board and Northport Associates.

This consultation process gave Manitoba Public Insurance an opportunity to connect with Manitobans and learn if they supported a new or different role for the Corporation given the merger of Driver and Vehicle Licensing (DVL) in 2004. Along with the general public, MPI spoke with a number of expert groups on road safety. Many of these groups have accountability for specific issues within the larger road safety framework. MPI found that many had not previously been asked about their perspectives on road safety, or how they, including Manitoba Public Insurance, might work together more effectively. *(The vital need for a coordinated and integrated approach is discussed further in this report.)*

13 Transport Canada Traffic Collision Statistics.2010

14 Statistics Canada, Annual Demographic Estimates: Canada, Provinces and Territories, 2011, Catalogue No. 91-215-X.

15 Statistics Canada, Canadian Vehicle Survey, Catalogue No. 53-223-XIE.

16 Safer Roads – Saving Lives and Preventing Injuries – Results of Public Consultation March 2012.

MPI also identified the need to look to the future of the growing province and identify how programming should change to reflect demographic trends. For example, the number of new immigrants is increasing yearly, and the fastest growing population is First Nations people. Both these demographics have unique cultural and service requirements that must be taken into account when considering their impact on road safety and any future programs.

The report then goes on to say *“The consultation process identified clear support for a broader role for Manitoba Public Insurance. Road safety is an issue that matters a great deal to the public and to the many stakeholders and expert groups in the province — who all have important mandates and strong viewpoints.*

Support from citizens for Manitoba Public Insurance’s actions seem grounded in clear understanding of the linkages between claims costs and rates. It has been and remains important to MPI to align their activities and programs with public expectations and to build public awareness and understanding for emerging approaches that can reduce risk on the road. With respect to the many stakeholder groups, the Corporation was gratified by their overwhelming call (8 out of 10) for Manitoba Public Insurance to lead and coordinate road safety efforts in the province, and to collaboratively develop a comprehensive road safety strategy.

An important consideration for the Corporation, as it works to answer the call for a new and perhaps broader role in the Manitoba road safety area will be how best to fund new initiatives that will not immediately result in lower claims’ costs.

For many years the Public Utilities Board of Manitoba (PUB), with the legislated mandate to review and approve basic Autopac rates, has been supportive of the Corporation taking an active role in road safety and in Order 122/10 at page 52, the PUB recommended that the Corporation establish a Road Safety Fund out of the Rate Stabilization Reserve, with the funds to be used for enhanced and new road safety research and initiatives. The Corporation takes the view that such a fund would be particularly appropriate where there are identified initiatives that have an expected measurable impact on claims costs, or that have a specific defined objective, so that as the funds are used, there is a decreasing need for further funding. The immobilizer fund is an example of where this approach worked well. However, many road safety initiatives do not have such a clear payback, although there may be consensus that the initiatives are worthwhile. In that case, it may be better to build the cost of the initiative into revenue requirements so the initiatives are sustainable.

The Consultation paper concludes clearly, there is support for a new and different role for Manitoba Public Insurance. The next step will be to develop a redefined road safety mandate that:

- Maximizes opportunities of the merger*
- Is appropriate to our legislative mandate and framework*
- Can be broadly supported by Road Safety experts, stakeholders and a large majority of ratepayers*
- Provides a stronger framework for reducing risk on Manitoba roadways”.*

Indeed, Manitoba Public Insurance is at a crossroads!

Chapter 2 – An overview of good practice programs

This Chapter describes an overall road safety management approach adopted by good practice countries, states and provinces. It also identifies the current status in Manitoba and makes recommendations in which the Province of Manitoba could introduce improved processes.

This information is based on the report “Implementing the Recommendations of the World Report on Road Traffic Injury Prevention - **Country Guidelines for the Conduct of Road Safety Management Capacity Reviews and the Specification of Lead Agency Reforms, Investment Strategies and Safe System Projects**”, which set out the key elements to be considered in assessing the road safety management capacity within any jurisdiction.

2.1 The Safe System Approach

Road safety is an undeniably complex system, but the road safety capacity of a country (or state/province) to achieve effective long-term sustainable road trauma reductions can usefully be assessed around three good practice dimensions.

These are:

- The presence of a results focus
- The existence of adequate institutional, management and coordination arrangements across government agencies
- The scope and quality of interventions and their rollout.

The Safe System Approach which has been introduced in Europe and Australia, and is currently the foundation for the Alberta Traffic Safety Plan seems to be showing great promise as a comprehensive approach to traffic safety. The progress over the past five years for the Province of Alberta can be seen in Table 4 in section 2.2.

What is the Safe System Approach?

As road users are human, crashes are always likely to happen even though there is a continuing focus on prevention. The safe system approach recognizes that there are limits to the capacity of the human body to survive various crash types above certain speeds of impact. It places a priority on systematically addressing major factors involved in specific crash types to achieve substantial road trauma reduction benefits over time. The safe system approach aims to minimize the severity of injury and is based on the premise that road users should not die because of system failings.

The basic premise for survivability is that when a five star driver (obeying the law), is driving a five star vehicle on a five star road and road side with a five star speed limit for the crash risk on that section of road, then any road user in or outside the vehicle should not - if they or the driver make a simple mistake or error of judgement - be subjected to a crash of such severity that they lose their life.

It assumes that:

- Crash analysis and ongoing development of better understanding of crash causes is a mainstream and continuing activity of road safety agencies
- Adequate road rules to provide safe travel and the necessary enforcement of those rules to achieve high levels of road user compliance are in place (both areas of great opportunity)
- That an adequate driver licensing system exists
- That an informed and aware community is supportive of the settings required to achieve and maintain an increasingly safe road transport system.

It challenges “system designers” to achieve a balance in the 3 key factors on the physical network – the road and roadside safety, the travel speed as influenced by speed limits and the primary and secondary safety features of vehicles in order to achieve safe conditions, which result in non-fatal crash outcomes. However, it also anticipates that there are many other “system designers”, beyond the road and vehicle engineers, who impact on safe use of the network and who also carry a major responsibility for safer, survivable outcomes.

The Safe System Approach can be summarised as:

- Safe roads- *that are predictable & forgiving of mistakes*
- Safe speeds- *travel speeds suit the function & level of road safety*
- Safe vehicles- *that prevent crashes & protect road users*
- Safe road use- *road users that are skilled & competent, alert & unimpaired. They comply with road rules, take steps to improve safety*

2.2 Results Focus

An effective results focus depends on all agencies accepting the performance objective of a lower road toll. Experience in many countries (and the Province of Alberta) has shown the benefits of a published *comprehensive Strategy*, with *Targets* which stretch the efforts of the government and agencies and are based upon quantified outcomes of proposed measures. This key principle demands that road safety agencies put much greater effort on monitoring “outcomes” rather than “outputs”.

Current situation: It would appear from the documentation reviewed that very little has been undertaken by MPI or the Province of Manitoba as a whole in this area.

Recommendation: Few provinces have developed (and published) integrated and comprehensive road safety strategies. In cooperation with MPI, the Province of Manitoba should consider developing a strategy similar to Alberta that has had a formal strategy since 2007. The Alberta Traffic Safety Plan can be found at www.saferoads.com. This multi-year strategic plan is supported through annual operating plans.

The results of these plans speak for themselves:

Table 4

	Baseline 1996- 2001	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	Target 2008- 2010
Fatalities	387	453	458	410	351	344	271
Seriously injured	2936	3812	3431	3298	2966	2972	2056
Fatalities per 100,000 population	13.4	13.2	11.4	9.5	9.2		
Fatalities per billion vehicle kilometres	10.0	9.6	8.6	7.1	n/a		

While the outcome for fatalities and serious injuries was above the desired target, it is important to note that since the introduction of the Traffic Safety Plan there has been positive movement towards the targets. This has taken place during a period of growth in population and increasing demand for transport, as follows:

- Population has increased 11% over the last five years
- Number of drivers has increased 12% over the last 5 years
- Compared to five years ago, the number of vehicles on Alberta's provincial roadways has increased by more than 450,000
- Traffic volumes on provincial highways increased by 11% over the last five years¹⁷

Greater effort needs to be placed on evaluating all traffic safety programs at MPI to ensure that the investments are being made in the most effective way for maximum results.

2.3 Implementation arrangements (institutional arrangements and management and coordination framework)

Good international practice in this area calls for effective arrangements in the following areas:

1. A framework for review of performance
2. Identifying a lead agency
3. Developing an effective strategy with robust targets
4. Effective multi-sectoral coordination and management
5. Appropriate Legislative framework
6. Strategic linkages between countermeasure programs and agencies
7. Road safety advocacy, promotion and publicity
8. Monitoring and evaluation.

A brief overview of these components follows.

17 Alberta Traffic Safety Plan 2015.

2.3.1 A framework for review of performance

Every organization should review, on an annual basis, the progress made towards the targets. Interim program performance indicators help illustrate how well road safety programs are doing in meeting their objectives or achieving the desired outcomes. They are a means of monitoring, assessing and evaluating the processes and operations of road safety systems. They use qualitative and quantitative information to help to determine a program's success in achieving its objectives. They can be used to track progress and can provide a basis to evaluate and improve performance.

Current situation: It would appear from the documentation reviewed that very little has been undertaken by MPI or the Province of Manitoba as a whole in this area.

Recommendation: A component of the road safety strategy should be the development of safety performance indicators which should include:

- Outcome measures – usually collision numbers or rates
- Intermediate measures – safety-related behaviours and attitudes which are expected to influence the likelihood of being involved in a collision (such as rates of seat belt and standard helmet use, overloading, speeding and red light running)
- Process (effort) measures – the type and amount of resources being expended to tackle road safety issues (e.g. speed camera hours, amount of advertising, number of blackspots treated).

Attached in Appendix A is an example of the cost (values) that ICBC uses to measure the performance of its very successful Road Improvement Program. ICBC has identified the potential cost (value) to them of a collision. The full program evaluation can be found at http://www.icbc.com/road-safety/Safer-roads/eval_report.pdf. Not all outcome measures will be this complex/scientific but at least program managers should be reviewing program costs and the potential claims savings.

2.3.2 Identifying a lead agency

It is vital that a lead agency is responsible and accountable and has the power to make decisions, manage resources and coordinate the efforts of all participating partners and stakeholders. In addition, integrated and coordinated arrangements between the relevant agencies, is required both - vertically (i.e., levels of government) and horizontally (departments/ agencies within a level of government), rather than having separate groups in behavioural, enforcement, infrastructure and vehicle safety activities who communicate infrequently.

Current situation: It would appear that a lead agency has not been identified in the Province of Manitoba. This is also related to the coordination and management arrangements which follow in this chapter. While strong relationships have been established between some partners there appears to be a lack of an overall plan of all partners working together towards a common goal of reducing the road toll.

Without a formal comprehensive and integrated strategy, the partners and stakeholders are acting independently “in silos”. This could be a waste (or duplication) of resources, not

contributing at all to a reduction in the frequency and severity of road crashes and their subsequent claims costs, which ultimately have an impact MPI's bottom line.

Who should be the lead agency?

Undertaking a full review of individual agency/partner roles and responsibilities is outside the scope of this document, however serious consideration should be given to identifying MPI as the lead agency. As discussed in Chapter 3 auto insurance companies have a key role to play in road safety, since they are the one agency whose “bottom-line” will be impacted by the frequency and severity of all traffic crashes and their subsequent claims costs.

In the first round of the Information Requests for this Rate Application process, MPI states:

While the Corporation is well positioned to lead driver education and road safety awareness initiatives, and to work with other like-minded and similarly mandated stakeholders to improve road safety outcomes, it is important to recognize the complex interdependencies that exist between road users, the vehicles they drive, the roads they drive on, and governing federal and provincial legislation/regulation, many of which fall outside the Corporation's current road safety mandate and framework.

In fact, this would probably be the response from all the partners, such as the Police, Health and Road Authorities. This in itself demands that one agency/or a formal partnership is developed that can oversee all the component parts of a comprehensive road safety strategy – not that this single agency is responsible for the “implementation” of the actions within the strategy but rather that they ensure that those who are responsible are in fact undertaking their duties in a complementary way. Without an agency mandated to be *responsible* and *accountable* for the results, no one is keeping an eye on the “vision” and consequently the actions that do take place are often ineffective.

Recommendation: The leaders of all the government and non-government agencies should get together and determine an organizational framework that can work for them. This will include identifying the lead agency.

2.3.3 Developing an effective strategy with robust targets

Development of road safety strategies should include modelled targets (where possible) that relate required decisions and resource inputs to the required components of the overall target outcomes. They should also be evidence based. Community consultation should be an integral component of this planning process.

In Canada, there are still few comprehensive provincial road safety strategies in place that reflect a whole of government response to the road safety challenge and even fewer examples of adopted provincial targets.

Although Canada's current RSV 2015 does not contain a national, formal target there is an expectation that jurisdictions should produce a document that set “stretching”, i.e., attainable but ambitious targets, reflecting the objectives of RSV 2015 in a regional context and represent a public commitment by Government at the political and bureaucratic level. An accompanying and more detailed Action Plan to guide specific interventions is also best practice.

Targets provide the focus for the comprehensive road safety strategy and influence decisions about coordination needs, legislative needs, funding and resource allocation, promotion needs, monitoring and evaluation as well as research, development and knowledge transfer. Research and experience indicate that long term goals and interim targets lead to:

- Increased political will and stakeholder accountability for road safety
- Closer management of strategies and programs, better safety programs and better safety performance, especially when the targets are ambitious
- Better use of public resource
- Increased motivation of stakeholders.

Current good practice involves a combination of top down long term goals as well as bottom up interim targets, which are soundly related to interventions, their likely effectiveness in the road safety strategy and the quality of their delivery.

Current situation: Despite reading of plans to develop an “evidence-based” comprehensive strategy for MPI it would appear that one is yet to be developed. Similarly the Province of Manitoba has yet to develop such a comprehensive plan.

There is also no evidence that targets and performance indicators for specific programs have been developed.

Recommendation: Section 2.2 above recommends the development of a comprehensive road safety strategy. This should include targets and performance measures, as outlined in section 2.3.1.

2.3.4 Effective multi-sectoral coordination and management

Coordination and management arrangements within jurisdictions between government agencies and the identification of departments’ accountabilities for results are fundamental steps in building effective road safety capacity.

In addition to coordinated efforts among various levels of government, a number of important non-government partners, such as police agencies and health professionals, play significant roles in the successful delivery of road safety initiatives. A coordinated road safety strategy recognizes the inherent limitations in individual engineering, enforcement and education efforts and advocates for an integrated multi-disciplinary response.

No one organization has either the resources or the mandate to undertake all road safety projects. Furthermore, because the scope of potential projects is diverse, it needs to be addressed by a wide range of stakeholders. It is important to work with and support existing community initiatives as well as cooperatively develop new programs and initiatives. This requires a networking approach, promoting cooperation and resource sharing amongst stakeholders.

Current situation: While some partnerships have been developed through MPI there seems to be generally a lack of ongoing coordination between government agencies and municipal

governments, other than for short-term, specific projects. MPI does seem to have a solid operational relationship with police agencies in the province.

Recommendation: As a whole the Province of Manitoba, in consultation with MPI, should develop an organizational framework that links all levels of government, individual government ministries, NGOs and where appropriate other partners. The Province of Alberta has developed an efficient organizational framework for managing road safety through the creation of an Office of Traffic Safety within the Ministry of Transportation. Orchestrating and aligning the actions and other related institutional management functions delivered by government partners and related community and business partnerships will help to achieve the desired focus on results. (This is also linked to the section above 2.3.2)

2.3.5 Appropriate Legislative framework

This implementation measure is the highly important introduction of new, and the review and adjustment of ineffective, legislative instruments, including examination of minimum mandatory penalties for certain offences and ease of enforceability to increase deterrence to make the laws work in a better manner.

Any new legislation should be based on research and good practice. International good practice generally pertains to targeted areas and might include: occupant restraints, impaired driving, speeding, intersection behaviour, commercial vehicles, young drivers, vulnerable road users, high risk drivers and aging drivers.

Current situation: As in all other provinces and territories there is a challenge in balancing legislation/regulations that are federal, provincial and municipal (by-laws). In reading the documentation presented Manitoba generally seems in-line with other provincial legislation in most program areas.

Recommendation: The Province of Manitoba and MPI should maintain its links with CCMTA and TAC to ensure that they remain abreast of those legislative changes that affect road safety.

2.3.6 Strategic linkages between countermeasure programs and agencies

Stronger linkages between infrastructure, vehicle safety and behavioural program practitioners is necessary to develop well-integrated safety programs and optimize potential benefits. At the provincial level in particular, there is a need for stronger linkage between infrastructure related road safety programs on one hand, and the behavioural programs. A good example of this and a key activity within the Safe Systems Approach is the issue of speed management. This is best undertaken through a combination of:

- appropriate legislation (speed limits);
- good signing practices so that drivers know the speed zone they are currently in;
- may include modifications to the road infrastructure through geometric design changes;
- public awareness to drivers of this important topic;
- focused and targeted enforcement in the most appropriate locations (at the crucial times); and

- ongoing monitoring of vehicle speeds.

More effective outcomes are possible when all elements of the road safety picture are considered together in a system-wide manner rather than in separate groupings.

Canada's latest Road Safety Vision 2015 supports the importance of strategic linkages and assists in this area by identifying lists of initiatives that are recommended as follows:

Proven Road User Initiatives

A number of road user initiatives have proven to be effective in addressing the challenges of dealing with those who drink and drive, speed or drive aggressively or refrain from buckling up. The "proven" initiatives are best practices, nationally and/or internationally, that have measured effectiveness in reducing fatalities and serious injuries. These are accompanied by performance measures. *This group of initiatives might best be used as in the most part they can show a clear positive effect on crashes.*

In addition to the initiatives that have been previously tested, many other potentially good initiatives have been reviewed but may be considered too "young" to demonstrate direct effectiveness in reducing fatalities and serious injuries. As such, there are no performance indicators for these initiatives.

Proven Infrastructure Initiatives

The infrastructure elements are diverse, and depending on the initiative, can address rural and urban situations, focusing on the road and the roadside. The objective of infrastructure initiatives is to reduce the likelihood and/or the severity of a collision, recognizing that, despite efforts to educate and control road users, driving errors will continue to be made. Generally, many of the initiatives have been evaluated and as such, their effect on collision rates after implementation can be estimated. These are accompanied by performance indicators.

Proven Vehicle Initiatives

Road safety advances for vehicles tend to be realized through innovative measures at the vehicle manufacturing level and through the Canadian Motor Vehicle Safety Standards (CMVSS). These are accompanied by performance indicators. A comprehensive list of initiatives can be found at Road Safety Vision 2015 – www.ccmta.ca.

Current situation: As mentioned in section 2.3.4 there appears to be little, if any, strategic linkage, particularly with Infrastructure, whether that is at the Provincial or Municipal level.

Recommendation: A move to a Safe System Approach would ensure that strategic links are developed and maintained, particularly with Infrastructure and Vehicle safety.

2.3.7 Funding

The financing of interventions and related institutional management functions on a sustainable basis and the allocation of appropriate resources to achieve the desired focus on results are keys to the strategy's effectiveness and success. Ideally there should be a number of streams of income to avoid the over dependency on a single source.

In many jurisdictions, government revenues are re-invested in road safety initiatives. These might include: fuel taxes; tire/battery disposal/environmental oil, oil filter and containers; motor vehicle licenses (and surcharges from offenders); traffic fines; victims of crime surcharge; and auto insurance premiums.

In good practice countries responsibility for annual funding rests with central government and there is access to sustainable and annual sources of road safety funding. At the same time there are established procedures to guide the allocation of resources cost-effectively across safety programs to ensure safety measures compete successfully with projects serving other societal aims. General good practice is to separate the funder, provider and delivery functions, to promote accountability and improve efficiency.

Typical Advantages and Disadvantages of Different Sources of Financing for Road Safety¹⁸

Sources of Funding	Advantages	Disadvantages
Value-added to State budget from transport	Large amount	New concept and difficult to evaluate
Surcharge for ensuring traffic safety in addition to funds collected from fines	Related directly to traffic safety and flexible enough for actual conditions of localities	Some requirements in institutional aspects
Surcharges on motor fuel	Low level of evasion, low collection fee	Difficulty to raise fuel prices
Surcharges on weight-distance charges	Accepted as user-charge	High level of evasion
Surcharges on compulsory vehicle insurance	Best related to road safety	High level of evasion
Surcharges on vehicle license fees	Low collection fee	High level of evasion
Surcharges on toll fees from roads	Low level of evasion, accepted as user charges	Toll roads form only a small part of the road network
Contribution by private sector	Can complement road safety financing and can make use of private sector management and efficiency	Can only provide limited amounts and may not be sustainable
Development loans and grants	Can initiate effective road safety programs and financing schemes	Not sustainable

2.3.8 Road safety advocacy, promotion and publicity

Improvement of road safety through more effective publicity and advocacy campaigns, in addition to government announcements expressing their vital support for programs that

¹⁸Source: JICA Study Team (2008) and ESCAP document No. E/ESCAP/CMG(4/I)/7 dated 30 July 2007.

reduce the severity and frequency of traffic crashes is a key activity, in addition to road safety campaign advertising. This includes sustained communication of road safety as a core business for government and society, emphasizing the shared societal responsibility to support the delivery of the interventions required to achieve the desired focus on results.

Promotion of the benefits of safer vehicles, safer behaviours and safer roads, roadsides and speed limits is an important role for government and government agencies.

But promotion of road safety is more than specific campaigns. It requires a clear strategy and program and agreed upon resources to become an everyday part of the community's life. Again, in good practice countries, this is the case with strong print and television advertising on road safety issues.

The creation of a supportive climate for road safety management requires increased public and professional understanding that the level of death and serious injury in using roads is disproportionate compared with the risks of other everyday activities. The aim is to decrease public acceptance of large numbers of road deaths and increase support for cost-effective measures to decrease the frequency and severity of fatal and serious injuries from motor vehicle collisions.

Strategic integration of advertising with other program components is essential. Media advertising may not change driver attitudes or behaviours directly but it can significantly impact other components such as enforcement or legislation if it is explicitly designed to support these components.

Current situation: MPI appears to undertake extensive media advertising and they have a large amount of road safety information, produced in quality brochures and leaflets, on their website. They also have in place a process to consult with public and monitor the public acceptance and perception of road safety programs and topics.

Recommendation: MPI should continue to monitor the effectiveness of their media and advertising programs to ensure they are “hitting the mark”. International research in the area of road safety advertising stresses the importance of always having an enforcement component, without which campaigns will have minimal or no effect. MPI should be encouraged to use other forms of social media when it comes to messaging aimed at young drivers/riders.

2.3.9 Monitoring and evaluation

The systematic and ongoing measurement of road safety outputs and outcomes and evaluation of interventions in terms of their achieving the desired focus on results is a key component of any road safety strategy. Monitoring and evaluation are undertaken for a range of purposes and the system developed must be able to perform these tasks. The purposes of monitoring and evaluation include:

- To measure progress
- To allow feedback and encouragement to the organizations involved
- To identify under-performance so that it can be addressed
- To identify emerging problems.

Each of these purposes demands that the system for monitoring and evaluation has particular characteristics:

- To be able to measure progress, the system must be able to measure current status which includes reviewing several databases
- To allow feedback and encouragement to the organizations involved, the system must produce outputs that are readily understood, have face value and be provided in a timely manner and compare this to previous status in a way that identifies the effects of the strategy
- To be able to identify under-performance, the system must incorporate some form of comparison with a performance target and provide feedback in a timely manner to allow corrections to be made
- To identify emerging problems, the system must monitor a range of indicators and must be able to predict likely future adverse trends, as far in advance as possible.

Current situation: As discussed in sections 2.2, 2.3.1 and 2.3.3 there seems to be little monitoring and evaluation of most of MPI's road safety programs. The exceptions to this are the monitoring of the High School Driver Education Program (discussed further in that section of Chapter 4) and the monitoring that followed the implementation of the Immobiliser program to reduce auto theft.

Recommendation: As a strategic road safety plan is developed, an integral component needs to be a robust Monitoring and Evaluation Plan.

Chapter 3 – The role of Auto Insurance companies in road safety

The interests of an insurance company as related to transportation are fairly straightforward. By reducing crash frequencies and severities, the claims paid out by the insurance company are reduced so this may translate into lower premiums for policy holders as well as higher dividends for shareholders. In reflecting on this, it is important to remember that the insurance industry pays out for every crash that involves an insured motorist. (No other industry in society is as affected by traffic safety). This “pure” interest in traffic safety positions insurance companies as ideal advocates and financiers of effective road safety programmes as long as sound business models are used to insure that predicted safety benefits have a higher value than the investment cost.

In general, there are three initiative categories and three delivery channels for road safety. The three initiatives to address road safety are commonly categorised into driver-related issues, vehicle-related issues and road-related issues. Driver improvements usually involve actions that can affect a motorist's driving ability or driver behaviour. Vehicle improvements include innovations to automobile design, resulting in an improved level of safety for the occupants of a vehicle. Road improvements involve changes to the design and character of a roadway, resulting in a more forgiving or safer road environment. Improvements to road safety have traditionally been delivered through three distinctly different approaches: education, enforcement and engineering. Education programmes are usually targeted at the road user in an attempt to improve skill, behaviour and awareness. Enforcement activities target erring drivers and involve any activity that governs or regulates motorised travel.

Engineering initiatives often target road and/or vehicle issues, where improved design elements can result in improvements to road safety performance.

As already mentioned, insurance companies clearly have a vested interest in reducing their claims costs through reduced collisions and injuries. The insurance industry in many countries has chosen to invest in road safety by sponsoring activities and projects. These include:

- Education and publicity
- Road safety grants and awards
- Driver training
- Vehicle safety
- Traffic law enforcement
- Road safety engineering improvements

In North America and Australia particularly there are many excellent examples of ways in which insurance companies actively participate in a broad range of activities. While the involvement of insurance companies in driver and public education and vehicle design initiatives is common all over the world, recently the support for initiatives aimed at the road engineering element of road safety has become a new activity.

International - Since 1989 the Transport Accident Commission (TAC) in the State of Victoria has focused on a range of road safety issues to change public behaviour. These campaigns include young drivers, fatigue, drug driving, motorcycle safety, distractions, vehicle safety, speeding and drink driving.

In 1990, the TAC donated 3 percent of its premium income to road safety activities. Within a few years, the donation had grown to almost 10 percent of premiums and funded the Victoria Solution programme, which halved deaths in less than 4 years.

Between 1992 and 1996 TAC invested \$85mAu in an Accident Blackspot Program (the result of a surplus) which reduced casualty crashes by 26.4% (4:1 ROI) and subsequent costs by 29.6% (5:1 ROI).¹⁹

TAC's current vision, through the Safe System Approach, is that no road deaths or injuries will occur and a future where every journey is a safe one. TAC believes this can be reached when every company, every business and every person – the whole community - takes responsibility for road safety.

In 2010/11 key road safety initiatives were:

- Safer Roads Infrastructure Program (\$84.3m)
- Public Education Campaigns including sponsorships (\$29.5m)
- Road Safety Programs (enhanced enforcement/schools education) (\$5m)
- Research (\$3m)

So, for the TAC, road safety programs represent both a financial investment decision, where programs are specifically developed to provide a predicted financial benefit to the insurance

¹⁹ TAC website – <http://www.tac.vic.gov.au/>.

scheme (e.g., the Safer Roads Infrastructure Program) and a policy decision designed to achieve a socially desirable outcome – to reduce transport incidents and severity for the Victorian Community. The TAC's status as a monopoly insurer provides it with access to details about almost all serious injury and fatal crashes. The ability to link this data with Victoria Police's crash data – further strengthens the TAC's ability to both look at causation and undertake in-depth evaluations of programs.

The TAC, unlike other Victorian road safety agencies is not legislatively required to address all road safety issues and tends to concentrate its efforts on issues where it believes it can make the biggest difference in terms of trauma numbers and outcomes and/ or to viability of the TAC scheme. Issues such as bicycle safety and heavy vehicle safety which have not to this point had a great impact on the TAC in terms of claim numbers or claims costs, are not addressed to any great extent.

Decisions about what to fund are made on the basis of business cases put to the TAC Board of Management. Historically, the TAC has felt it could make the "biggest difference" by addressing behavioural issues such as drunk driving, speeding, seat belt wearing and fatigue together with road infrastructure (blackspot) improvements.

A very interesting initiative has been the introduction of a motorcycle levy program. In 2002, following a review of the TAC premium paid by motorcycles (premium is paid on a vehicle), the Government decided that rather than increase the premium in-line with their costs to the TAC scheme, that it would place a motorcycle safety levy on the motorcycle premium. Initially \$50, the levy was to go into a fund that would specifically be used to improve the safety of motorcycle riders. Initially the levy raised around \$4 million per annum. Despite being very unpopular with motorcyclists, the levy has continued. Increasing numbers of motorcycle registrations means that the amount collected is now around \$6 million per annum. The levy fund has supported a range of projects dedicated to improving rider safety. Examples of projects funded by the levy are:

- Road infrastructure treatments on many popular motorcycling routes
- Police enforcement activity (with a focus on motorcycle safety)
- Mass media public education campaigns
- Research
- A trial of on-road coaching as a safety measure
- Education materials on making roads motorcycle friendly for road designers and
- Constructors

The TAC, as the monopoly third party insurer in Victoria takes its responsibility and subsequent investments seriously. Its key priorities remain:

- Educating the public about risks on the roads, providing supporting data and research evidence to the community
- Drawing on data from TAC claims, police crash reports, police enforcement, registration and licensing to identify key risks and developing and evaluating road safety initiatives
- Working cooperatively with other government agencies and stakeholders in road safety to ensure a well coordinated approach
- Setting targets and working within a strategy framework

- Learning from and adapting to new evidence from other jurisdictions about what works in road safety
- Investing in initiatives that reduce the burden of road trauma not only the TAC scheme but the community as a whole.

However, the TAC insurance scheme is unique, with its investments in road safety having their roots in legislative rather than financial or pure economic objectives. That said, many of the programs the TAC undertakes, particularly those which involve substantial amounts of money, are expected to and do provide a healthy return on investment to the TAC scheme.²⁰

United States

- **State Farm Insurance** is the largest property/casualty mutual insurance Company in the US with 37 million insured vehicles. As a result of its significant presence in the marketplace, State Farm has had a long term policy of working to reduce the physical, emotional and economic impact of crashes through vehicle and highway safety awareness and research. In 1999, State Farm queried its 1998 claim databases to identify the most crash prone at-grade intersections in the US based on claims reported to the company. A significant difference between State Farm and the other insurance company programmes is that State Farm independently identified and selected the locations, which were studied to identify deficiencies. This was not too well received by road authorities concerned. In addition, the State Farm media campaign (NBC-Dateline) which introduced this initiative was partially intended to raise awareness of the State Farm brand. This is not the best way that this very significant program should be presented, since this is probably the most significant road safety program that can provide some realistic, positive benefits for road safety.
- **AAA Michigan** is the state of Michigan's biggest auto insurer with a long history of highway safety initiatives. It launched a road improvement program in 1997 modelled on the ICBC experience. AAA Michigan utilises an economic evaluation model to justify its' investment in road improvements based on the expected reduction in crash frequency and severity due to the improvements, prorated according to AAA Michigan's market share. AAA Michigan was the first North American example of a private insurance company that owns a partial share of the market launching a program that assists communities to improve roads.

Many insurance companies in the US (and other countries) also provide "incentives" (usually through premium costs) for people who take advanced driver courses, such as the Defensive Driving Course. While there is no definitive evidence that a driver who has attended such a course is in fact any better than one who hasn't, the insurance companies see this as a brand marketing tool.

Canada

All four Government Insurance schemes in Canada take a very keen interest in reducing their claims costs through road safety programs. Assuming that MPI is fully aware of the expertise and programs undertaken by them, they are not covered in this report. The biggest challenge is "Which programs are providing a positive return on their investment (through reductions in

²⁰ The majority of the "International" commentary was derived from: Road Safety – the Experience of the Transport Accident Commission in Victoria, Australia - Samantha Cockfield (TAC) for the International Transport Forum – September 2011.

traffic crashes) and which programs are more a demonstration of a desire for increased public awareness of the company or a Corporate Social Responsibility activity?” The only sure way to determine this is to undertake a formal evaluation of the impacts of the program on traffic crashes and subsequent claims costs. Of course there is a need for both types of programs.

An example of one effort in formal evaluation is set out below:

Example: Saskatchewan Government Insurance²¹

In 2012 an independent assessment of their Child Passenger Safety Program was undertaken, followed by an economic analysis of the Child Passenger Safety Program. The results were as follows:

Assuming that the Child Passenger Safety Program was solely responsible for decreasing child passenger injury and death; the return on investment ranges from 10.48:1 when excluding the estimated emergency room and ambulance costs, to 13.64:1 when including these costs, based upon the TAIS data for measuring child passenger mortality. Therefore, for every dollar invested in prevention, there are \$10 to \$14 in direct health care costs avoided.

This range for the return on investment for every dollar invested in prevention increases when based upon the Vital Statistics data for measuring child passenger mortality. In this case, the return on investment ranges from 12.54:1 when excluding the estimated emergency room and ambulance costs, to 15.69: 1 when including these costs. Therefore, for every dollar invested in prevention, there are \$12 to \$16 in direct health care costs avoided.

The true return on investment for every dollar invested in the Child Passenger Safety program lies somewhere below these levels.

Chapter 4 – Review of MPI Road Safety Programs

This Chapter reviews many of the road safety programs undertaken through MPI, or in partnership with MPI. Additional discussion of some of the subject matters can be found in Appendices B, C, D, E and F.

4.1 General Overview

MPI's website indicates that their goal: *is to lead initiatives on education to increase opportunities for drivers to enhance their driving skills and to increase public concern regarding risky driving behaviour.*

The goals for the road safety programs include:

- *Having road safety become (and remain) a provincial priority for Manitobans as well as for decision-makers who have a mandate to enhance public safety.*

21 Pike, et al – 23rd Canadian Multi-disciplinary Road Safety Conference, Montreal, Quebec – May 26-29, 2013.

- *Reducing public tolerance for injuries and fatalities related to road transportation and promoting an environment where crashes will become (and remain) a significant public health concern.*
- *Ensuring that Manitobans become more safety conscious, and the organizations tasked with improving road safety will incorporate the principles of safety conscious planning into their programs, projects, initiatives, and campaigns.*

The strategy is to:

- *Develop and manage education initiatives about the causes of accidents and how to prevent them.*
- *Support community-based initiatives that promote road safety awareness and education.*

To achieve these goals, Road Safety focuses on the following major issues:

- *Speed*
- *Occupant safety*
- *Impaired driving*
- *Vulnerable road users*
- *Driver education*
- *Auto crime*

While Manitoba Public Insurance has a vested interest in improving road safety in Manitoba, it is recognized that the Corporation is but one of many organizations in the Province with a similar mandate and areas of responsibility and accountability.

Manitoba Public Insurance supports Transport Canada's 2015 Vision and targets.²²

The 2011 Traffic Collision Statistics Report suggests the following should be the key road safety topics in Manitoba:

- *Speed*
- *Distracted driving*
- *Impaired driving*
- *Occupant restraints*
- *Young drivers*
- *Rural roads*

²² MPI website.

The 2014 Rate Application, SM.5 Road Safety presents the projected budget for 2014/2015 as follows:

Table 5

Program category	Amount	% of total budget
1.Driver education – includes all internal & external expenses, HSDE, mature drivers and other driver training programs	\$4,346,000	37.5%
2.Auto crime – includes WATTS, WPS, Crown Attorney funding, fingerprinting service, grants, immobilizer incentives	\$2,963,000	25.6%
3.Road Safety Advertising and Sponsorships – includes various methods to reach a wide and varied audience including 60 sec. driver, Winnipeg Free Press tips and CJOB radio, professional sporting sponsorships, partnerships with TADD & SADD, Safety Services Manitoba, Operation Red Nose, etc.	\$2,150,000	18.6%
4. Road Safety Programming – includes expenses and program costs for targeted risk groups, which include speed, wildlife, impaired, distracted, motorcycle, ATV/snowmobile, cycling, pedestrians and occupant safety.	\$1,543,000	13.3%
5.Road watch – includes enforcement and enhancement	\$403,000	3.5%
6.Surveys and program evaluation	\$182,000	1.6%
TOTAL	\$11,587,000	100%

This represents an investment of 1.4% of basic insurance costs.

This distribution of expenses leads one to ask the question – Why would over 60% of the total budget be dedicated to only 2 programs? While the return on investment for funding auto crime initiatives has been clearly demonstrated through a vast reduction in auto crime, this is not the case for the High School Driver Education program.

4.2 Driver Education

(Budget for Driver Education and Improvement:

2012/13 – Actual: \$3,102,000

2013/14 – Forecast: \$3,307,000)

The fact that young drivers are over-represented in traffic crashes is clear from the information presented in the Traffic Collisions Statistics Reports. International research reveals little evidence that there is a positive impact in reducing collisions through traditional driver education programs.

It is obvious from the Traffic Collisions Statistics Report 2011 that many young drivers continue to undertake high risk behaviours.

The youngest drivers in Manitoba continue to have the highest rates of involvement in collisions.

In 2011, those aged 16 to 19 have a relative involvement of 914.4, which is:

- 3% higher than those aged 20 to 24
- 31% higher than those aged 25-34
- 50% higher than those aged 35-44
- 68% higher than those aged 45-54
- Twice that of those aged 55-64; and
- Nearly three times that of those aged 65 and older.

The relative collision involvement rate for drivers in the 16-19 year age group increased by almost 19% compared to 2010 and by almost 8% compared to the previous five year annual average.²³

Approximately 38% of MPI's annual budget for road safety is used to administer Manitoba's High School Driver Education (HSDE) program and other driver training programs such as Resource Rangers, Citizen's Bridge and the Mature Driver training programs.

MPI's website states: *Manitoba's High School Driver Education Program has a proud history of helping prepare young Manitoba drivers for the road. Courses are taught by approximately 300 instructors at 170 high schools across Manitoba. The program is open to all students who attend a Manitoba high school on a full-time basis. Home-schooled students are also eligible.*

The program is unique as student participation is heavily subsidized by MPI. A student pays \$50 for the course and MPI covers the rest of the costs (approximately \$350 per student). Approximately 12,000 teen drivers take advantage of this subsidy. The belief is that making

23 Traffic Collisions Statistics 2011.

driver education affordable and accessible is one of the best ways to keep Manitobans safe on our roads.

The Driver Education course includes:

- *34 hours of classroom instruction*
- *8 hours of behind-the-wheel training with a certified driving instructor*
- *8 hours of in-car observation*

Students are also required to practice with a parent, guardian or other qualifying supervising driver for a minimum of 24 hours.

The course covers topics such as basic driving skills, rules of the road, novice drivers' risk assessment, impaired driving consequences, defensive driving, winter challenges and gravel road driving.

The course content has been evaluated and updated several times over the past 10 years. Yet any evidence of how successful the program has been in improving the safe driving leading to reduced traffic collisions involving new drivers seems to be absent.²⁴ Since Manitoba has a comprehensive Graduated Driver Licensing Program they are well placed to monitor all new drivers.

As already mentioned, approximately 12,000 students per year enroll in the HSDE. According to the Traffic Collisions Statistics Report 2011 there are in fact almost 23,000 16 and 17 year olds holding some form of drivers' license in Manitoba. What is unclear is how many young drivers have not taken any formal training.

Program evaluation

ADTSEA

The recently commissioned study "Global Analysis of Emerging, Promising and Best Practices in Driver Education" is currently being undertaken by the American Driver and Traffic Safety Education Association (ADTSEA). According to the study's Executive Summary:

This study is a comprehensive in-depth global analysis of driver education programs including an inventory of current best practices and new and emerging strategies that may contribute to the effectiveness of driver education programs. It will also include information from 23 other countries on their driver training programs for young drivers.

ADTSEA goes on to report the following:

1. Basic Driving Skills – ADTSEA concludes that driver education standards and components for updating a basic driver education program are promising practices for basic driving skills. The literature and survey findings determined that basic driver education programs should be substantially updated. The

²⁴ An older assessment of the impact of driver education in the Manitoba context can be found in the study by Lonero et al. *A Longitudinal Analysis of Manitoba Public Insurance Driver Education Program*, Final Report, July 17, 2001. This is referenced in the response to CAC/MPI 2-29 of this GRA as well as in CAC/MSOS (MPI) 1-25 in the 2009/2010 GRA.

traditional method of driver education, which includes basic driving skills, **does not reduce the number of novice driver crashes**. Updates are recommended to be made to the basic driver education program. [emphasis added]

2. Parent/Guardian Involvement – Programs and instructional materials need to be developed to encourage and teach parents/guardians how to manage young driver risks and not just to teach the teens how to drive. The more experience a novice driver has with their parent/guardian the better prepared they will be for the licensing test and solo driving.
3. Safe Driving Practices – It is recommended that a second phase or Segment II training curriculum for Advanced In-Vehicle Hazard Perception and Avoidance Training be established. This higher order training is a best practice. Almost all countries reviewed are working towards the goal of incorporating higher order training into their driver education program.
4. Vehicle telematics – ADTSEA concludes that vehicle telematics are an emerging practice. Typically, products consist of those parents/guardians can use to track their teens after receiving their license.
5. Technologies for delivering Driver Education – Several technologies are presented, including Simulator Systems. While these allow novice drivers to reproduce driving in a controlled, virtual environment without the risk of driving in a real world environment, the costs of them may be prohibitive.
6. Driver Instructor Training – The development of well-trained instructors is vital in a quality program. Specialized courses for instructor training are recommended.

Additional conclusions from ADTSEA:

- It is vital that substantial experience be attained in lower-risk conditions before unrestricted solo driving.
- High levels of accompanied practice before licensing for solo driving, conducted in a methodical manner that involves a variety of driving circumstances, will result in lower levels of fatalities.
- At least 50 hours of pre-licensing practices are recommended in any system, experience in one of the countries surveyed showed that increasing this to approximately 120 hours reduced crashes in the two years following licensing by about 40%. **(This suggests that the current amount of practice time (between the certified instructor and the parent) should be significantly increased.)**

Northport Associates MPI HSDE program Formative Evaluative Project

A second report “HSDE program – Formative Evaluation Project” prepared by Northport Associates provided a summary of the HSDE Formative Evaluation Project over five years of its contracted work (from March 2008-August 2012).

There are two main types of program evaluation: *formative evaluation*; so called because its function is to help *form* a program into a more effective operation, and *summative evaluation*, which helps *sum* up program outcomes and impacts. The importance of summative evaluation cannot be understated and should be a key evaluation activity for MPI for this program.

It is interesting to note that in the summary of the project activities by program area and year, the following comments were made:

Program Evaluation Needs & Assessment – Year 4 activities – ***“Due to staff changes & program priorities, the Work plan was not finalized until February 2011 thus shortening the Evaluation Cycle.”***

Business Processes – Instructor Support – Year 4 activities – ***“Additional meetings were postponed due to staff changes and insufficient resources/time.”***

Program Development – Year 4 activities – ***“Postponed strategic planning sessions due to major program changes.” “Due to staff changes and insufficient resources, an update of the Formative Evaluation Implementation plan did not take place.”***

Instructional processes – Curriculum Delivery-In-Class, In-Car – Year 2 activities – ***“Due to MPI Driver Education staff changes; this was not initiated in Year 2.”*** Year 3 activities – ***“Due to resource limitations, the parent survey was eliminated from the Formative Evaluation Project”.***

Instructional processes – Professional Development – Year 2 activities – ***“Due to lack of staff and low priority, additional evaluation of the Professional Development feedback form did not take place.”*** Year 4 activities – ***“Proposed gap analysis of Professional Development was to be included in the IPC (Instructor Preparation Course) Jurisdiction Review. This did not take place due to the lack of response from key jurisdictions to IPC inquiries. Finalization of the Professional Development strategy is on hold, pending further decisions on the IPC.”*** [Emphasis added]

Since close to 40% of the Road Safety budget is dedicated to the HSDE program one would have assumed that this would be the MPI priority, but the note above may suggest this is not the case. In the long run the lack of priority and resources may have had an impact on the evaluation process.

Northport Associates Large Scale Evaluation of Driver Education (Summative)

During the implementation of the Formative Evaluation Project, a summative evaluation of intermediate outcomes has also been ongoing at MPI. The Large Scale Evaluation of Driver Education (LSEDE) Project is a multi-year, multi-level, multi-site summative evaluation co-sponsored in Manitoba by the AAA Foundation for Traffic Safety (AAAFTS) and MPI. The latest update for this project was 2010.

The conclusions and recommendations include the following:

Theory in driver education is still weak and shows little improvement. Driver education delivery is highly fragmented, and both consolidation and further fragmentation appear to be taking place simultaneously. Driver education needs to be more firmly based in sound research and theory concerning young drivers and, at the same time, in the principles of effective behavior change. It needs better management of the linkage of driver education with parental and community influences, graduated licensing, and other behavioral influences such as incentives and cultural factors.

Comprehensive and systematic evaluation research can be a constructive and important part of future development in driver education. A comprehensive approach to evaluation addresses program theory, context, products, processes, and management, as well as outcomes and impacts. The need for such research is increasing, as vigorous development is occurring in some public and private programs. The previously published AAAFTS Guidelines have provided new materials and direction, and support for more systematic evaluation appears to be growing. If the apparent trends toward data-driven development can be sustained and expanded, they could ultimately lead to improved safety outcomes.

While a thorough analysis of these reports is outside the scope of this report, the reports posed several recommendations, which are worthy of serious consideration by MPI.

4.3 Graduated Driver Licensing

Although the Graduated Driver Licensing program (GDL) does not fall under the Road Safety portfolio at MPI it is intrinsically linked with the High School Driver Education Program.

MPI's website describes the Graduated Driver Licensing program as a three-stage program designed to help new drivers, regardless of age, acquire the knowledge and skill needed to safely operate a motor vehicle. Whether drivers are 16 or 60, GDL enables new drivers to gain more experience under a greater variety of driving conditions.

GDL is intended to reduce accidents among new drivers by allowing them to gain valuable driving experience under controlled conditions, thereby lowering the risk of vehicle collisions. Statistics show that new drivers are three times more likely to have an accident than experienced drivers. GDL does not discriminate by age, gender or geographic location.

Details of Manitoba's Graduated Driver License Program can be found in Appendix B.

One of the weaknesses of the High School Driver Education program, identified in the Formative Evaluation report (Northport Assoc.), is ***“Weak coordination with GDL (e.g. Single stage program).”*** [Emphasis added]. It also goes on to suggest that:

Another key need has been bringing driver education and Graduated Driver Licensing into a structure that allows them to complement and reinforce the potential benefits of each. Coordination of driver education with GDL is recommended in the US NHTSA Novice Teen Driver Education and Training Administrative Standards. No jurisdiction in North America has moved yet to adopt this aspect of the new standards. The New Model for MPI's HSDE Program is extended in time to better complement GDL and

enhance learning effectiveness. It represents a large and leading step toward meeting the clear and urgent need for “graduated” driver education.

Based on the information available in TIRF’s Young and Driver Resource Centre, it appears that the Manitoba GDL program falls somewhat short of programs in other provinces, as follows:

Learner stage:

- No minimum exit stage – most provinces between 16 & 17 years
- No minimum age of supervising driver – most provinces 18+ years
- BAC of supervising driver - .05, some others 0.0
- No nighttime driving restrictions – most others between 12am-5am
- No electronics – BC and PEI have a ‘no electronics’ clause
- No lower point penalty threshold

Novice stage:

- No parental consent required
- Time completion 15 months – 5 provinces between 18 and 24 months
- No exit test
- BC has a minimum age of supervising driver at 25 years

On the positive side, TIRF reports that Manitoba has a requirement for novice drivers to be accompanied between 12am-5am and the novice driver has to maintain a 0.0BAC for 36 months.

Recommendation: MPI should take a serious look at the future potential and effectiveness of the HSDE as recommended in the Northport Associates report. If MPI is satisfied, **after a formal and robust summative evaluation (a key priority)**, that HSDE is having positive impacts on the performance of new drivers, then it should be prepared to fully resource such a venture, financially and with the necessary human resource commitment.

4.4 Occupant restraints

(Budget for Occupant Safety Education strategies:

2012/13 – Actual: \$357,000

2013/14 – Forecast: \$308,000)

Occupant restraints include head restraints, seat belts and child safety seats. MPI’s website provides a great amount of information on all these.

4.4.1 Seat belts

MPI’s website suggests that:

seat belts reduce your chances of being seriously injured or killed in a collision by almost **half**. It’s important to keep in mind that half of all collisions occur within **55 km** of home. Short trip or long, seat belts can save your life. Transport Canada released their 2005 observational survey on seat belt statistics across the country. Manitoba ranked first in rural seat belt use at 92.4% and third in urban seat belt use at 93.3%. Increases in seat belt use can be attributed to Manitoba having one of the highest fines

in the country (\$292.65), 2 demerits against unbelted drivers, high enforcement levels, and educational programs stressing the importance of buckling up.

Despite this, **39% of those killed on Manitoba roadways in 2011 were not wearing or using the available safety equipment** at the time of the collision.

A good example of a comprehensive occupant restraint strategy is in the Province of Alberta, through the Alberta Occupant Restraint Program (AORP).

The website indicates “the Alberta Occupant Restraint Program (AORP) originated in 1995 as a child passenger restraint program aimed at improving the safety of children in vehicles across Alberta. In 1999, the program expanded its mandate to the correct use of seat belts by adults as well. By improving the use of occupant restraints, AORP aims to reduce the injuries, trauma and deaths resulting from motor vehicle crashes.

Since 1999, AORP has coordinated a number of initiatives to get Albertans to use all types of occupant restraints correctly for every ride with great results. The strengths of the program include diverse partnerships, coordination, education, public awareness, enforcement and evaluation. Regular evaluation has ensured that the program remains on target with both provincial and national traffic safety goals and objectives”.

Additional information can be found at <http://www.albertaseatbelts.ca>

Recommendation: MPI should continue supporting this topic as a key priority, together with its partners, as identified in the 2013 Manitoba Awareness and Enforcement Integrated Calendar. It is also recommended that MPI find a stakeholder/partner who may be willing to undertake roadside seat belt and child safety seat surveys.

4.4.2 Child passenger safety

MPI's website reports:

The safety of children travelling in vehicles is very important. Child car seats (also called child restraints) make road travel safer for children. They keep children in place, so that in a sudden stop or crash, the child has increased protection. This will reduce the chances of serious injury or even death.

Provincial law requires placing children in the appropriate car seat until they are at least 145 cm (4' 9"), 36 kg (80 lb.) or nine years old.

Unfortunately, 80 per cent of child car seats are used incorrectly. That's why Manitoba Public Insurance has introduced the **Manitoba Child Car Seat Program**, which offers free child car seat inspections throughout the province by technicians who are nationally certified through St. John Ambulance. Manitoba Public Insurance provides no-cost training, support and information to technicians and instructors. Technicians range from emergency services personnel to community members.

In Chapter 4 there is information from Saskatchewan Government Insurance regarding a formal economic analysis and evaluation of their child passenger safety program, indicating a

positive return on the investment in the program. In response to one of the questions posed in the second round of Information Requests (IR) (CAC/CAA (MPI) 2-28) about this program, MPI reports that it has reviewed this study, that they believe there are similarities between the programs in both provinces and they do not plan to undertake a similar evaluation in Manitoba in the near future.

Recommendation: *At least every 4 or 5 years MPI should do an evaluation of this program to ensure it is effective. It is also recommended that MPI find a stakeholder/partner who may be willing to undertake roadside seat belt and child safety seat surveys.*

4.5 Speeding

(Budget for Speed management strategies:

2012/13 – Actual: \$330,000

2013/14 – Forecast: \$281,000)

MPI's website reports that:

through the Speed Management program, the goal at Manitoba Public Insurance is to influence attitude and behaviour change in Manitoba motorists through education and increased awareness of the dangers related to speeding and how speed contributes to crashes.

Most people think speeding is driving above the maximum speed limit. But speeding can also refer to travelling too fast for weather, road or traffic conditions – even if you aren't exceeding the speed limit.

- Speeding is a significant traffic safety problem. In fact, it is one of the most-reported factors associated with crashes.
- Speeders typically fail to adjust their speed to the prevailing conditions including the flow of traffic.

Speeding can also affect you and your vehicle in a variety of other ways:

- Higher speeds reduce the ability of vehicles and safety systems to protect occupants, reducing the effectiveness of automobile systems such as braking, steering and tire traction.
- Economic costs:
- Fines – minimum \$105
- Increases driver's licence and insurance premiums
- Impacts your Driver Safety Rating level
- Increases fuel cost: Fuel efficiency, litres per kilometre, decreases steadily above 65 km/h. - Passenger cars and light trucks use approximately 50 percent more fuel travelling at 120 km/h than they do at 90 km/h
- Environmental costs: As speed increases, pollutants increase. From 90 km/h to 110 km/h, there is a 100 percent increase in carbon monoxide emissions, 50 percent increase in hydrocarbons, and 31 percent increase in nitrogen oxides.

According to the Traffic Collision Statistics Report 2011:

- Speed is a contributing factor in 19.9% in traffic collisions, an increase of almost 7% from the previous five year average
- In young drivers, aged 16-19 (per 10,000 licensed drivers), speed as a contributing factor is 56.6, which was actually a decrease from the previous 5 years
- Speed is a contributing factor in 4.7% of all collisions, 31.9% of fatal collision and 5.5% of injury collisions.

Roughly 75 per cent of Manitobans surveyed believe speeding is a serious problem on their roads.

Most of the programs aimed at reducing speeding are undertaken by other partners, such as the Police and Municipal and Provincial road authorities. These programs include enforcement and engineering measures. As indicated earlier in this document, speed management is one of the best examples of the need for a comprehensive, multi-faceted approach.

MPI invests between \$350,000 and \$400,000 in speed management strategies, one of which is Speedwatch.

Speedwatch

MPI's website indicates that:

Speedwatch is a community-based initiative through which volunteers from organized community groups, schools or concerned citizens (26 groups across the province) have access to loaned radar-operated speed reader boards that display the posted speed limit and the passing driver's speed. The aim of the program is to raise awareness of speeding concerns in local communities and to prompt speeding drivers to slow down, while giving positive reinforcement to those who drive within the posted speed limit.

Similar programs to this have shown to be a positive contributor to speed-related collisions in the UK and in British Columbia.

It is essential that this program continues to be monitored for its effectiveness in slowing down vehicles. In some instances it is useful for the local police to do some enforcement in addition to the warnings given by the community groups, particularly for those who are "slow learners".

SAFER SPEEDS is one of the four cornerstone areas of intervention in the Safe System Approach (Chapter 2) to reduce fatalities and serious injuries on our roads. This requires a two-pronged approach:

- **Setting appropriate speed limits** – Particular attention should be paid to lower speeds limits in areas frequented by vulnerable road users particularly, such as pedestrians, cyclists, etc. and in places where children congregate, such as schools, parks and playground zones.
- This should be then supported with **Compliance with the speed limits**. Expansion of fixed and mobile safety cameras in urban areas, and average speed

safety cameras on major highways as well as more closely aligning speeding penalties with the road safety risk.

The Insurance Corporation of British Columbia has been funding enhanced enforcement in partnership with the police agencies for almost twenty years. Their current investment is in the order of \$20million annually. A comprehensive monitoring and evaluation process ensures the police are using these funds on key priorities, such as speeding, impaired driving, etc.

While MPI may not be the lead on a speed management initiative, it certainly has a keen business interest in ensuring that those who do are addressing this as a key priority.

It would appear from MPI that they have not directly funded any speed enforcement campaigns and subsequently they have not seen a need to evaluate their outcomes.²⁵

In July 2011 the Traffic Injury Research Foundation completed an “Evaluation of the Photo Enforcement Safety program of the City of Winnipeg”. This included a review of the Intersection safety cameras and the mobile radar (speed enforcement). One of the conclusions was:

The use of mobile photo radar cameras is an integral part of Winnipeg's Photo Enforcement Program. Therefore, data were collected to also evaluate this aspect of the Program. **Unfortunately, due to limitations of the data it was impossible to draw any meaningful conclusions about the effectiveness of these mobile radar cameras.** It is recommended that efforts are made to improve data collection in a follow-up study to enable the evaluation of this aspect of the Program.

Two key points are raised in the TIRF report:

1. The importance of making a plan for collecting data before the intervention, and
2. Comments are made by the public during the Public Opinion Poll that will be very important for MPI to consider when preparing advertising campaigns on the topic of speeding. Of particular relevance to MPI advertising and awareness initiatives are the three “*Recommendations from the Public Opinion Poll*” which are identified in the TIRF report.

The detailed recommendations on the TIRF report can be found in Appendix C.

Recommendation: *MPI should ensure that the advertising related to speeding is targeted at the appropriate audience, using the most appropriate medium. They should also ensure (through commitments from the Police) that there will be enhanced enforcement on the topic during the advertising periods. (International good practise suggests that advertising alone, (without any enforcement) is money wasted).*

It is further recommended that MPI have a discussion with ICBC as to the cost effectiveness of investing in enhanced enforcement focused on speeding.

25 CAC/CAA(MPI) 2-12.

4.6 Impaired driving

(Budget for Impaired driving strategies:

2012/13 – Actual: \$877,000

2013/14 – Forecast: \$724,000)

According to MPI's website:

When most people think about impaired driving, they think of driving under the influence of alcohol. While alcohol is the most common form of impaired driving, there are other, less obvious types of impairment. The safe operation of any motor vehicle requires drivers to be alert, in complete control at all times, able to concentrate on the task at hand and respond to changing traffic, road and weather conditions. Impairment, whether by alcohol, drugs or fatigue, significantly affects driving abilities and places drivers, passengers and other road users in harm's way.

4.6.1 Drinking/driving

The 2011 Traffic Collision Statistics Report presents the following information on alcohol related collisions:

- In 2011, impaired driving contributed to 28 fatalities and 45 people being seriously injured.
- On average from 2006-2010, 33 people were killed each year and 61 were seriously injured in collisions involving impaired driving.
- Two-thirds of collisions involving alcohol impairment occur on weekends, and
- 39 per cent of alcohol-related collisions occur between 9 p.m. and 3 a.m.
- *In 2010, drivers aged 16-24 years represented 14.5 per cent of licensed drivers, yet accounted for nearly a third of all alcohol impaired driving convictions.*
- *In 2010, licensed drivers aged 25-44 years represented a third of drivers on Manitoba roadways, yet accounted for close to nearly half of all alcohol impaired driving convictions.*

In the [Traffic Injury Research Foundation](#) (TIRF) report *Alcohol-Crash Problem in Canada: 2010*, it is suggested that four in ten fatally injured drivers in Manitoba in 2010 had been drinking. Among the fatally injured drinking drivers:

- over three quarters of these drivers had an illegal blood alcohol level at the time of the collision
- males accounted for 93 per cent of all of the fatally injured drivers who were legally impaired

According to MPI's website:

Manitoba is recognized as having some of the toughest anti-impaired driving legislation in country. In addition to existing Canadian impaired driving laws, Manitoba has included a number of sanctions intended to deter motorists from driving impaired and measures to reduce the likelihood of repeat occurrences.

MPI has developed partnerships with other stakeholders to reduce drinking and driving through a variety of programs which are discussed in Appendix D.

According to MADD Canada's recent review of provincial/territorial programs:

Manitoba ranked second in MADD Canada's 2009 assessment of the provincial and territorial legislation across Canada. It has introduced some minor impaired driving initiatives in the interim. Relative to the national standard, Manitoba has not fared well in terms of per capita impairment related crash deaths and the percentage of total crash deaths that were impairment related. While the province has strong programs in many areas, it needs to enhance several aspects of its impaired driving legislation.

In 2009, Manitoba's per capita rate of impairment-related crash deaths was in the mid-range, but it had the third highest percentage of total crash deaths that were impairment related. During the 10-year period from 2000 to 2009, Manitoba made no progress.

In MADD Canada's view, of greatest concern has been the increases in the province's per capita rate of impairment-related crash deaths. Given its record, the province needs to adopt additional legislative reforms.²⁶

In August 2011, Manitoba increased the short-term Administrative Licensing Suspensions (ALS) for second, third, fourth, and subsequent occurrences from 24 hours to 15, 30 and 60 days, respectively. The legislation also increased the look back period for repeat occurrences from 3 to 10 years. The legislation also eliminated the seven-day appeal period for drivers who received a three-month ALS.

This report made several recommendations for improvement in the following areas:

- Licensing
- License suspension and revocation
- Interlocks
- Vehicle Impoundment and Forfeiture.²⁷

The Province of Manitoba indicates it has responded to the comments by MADD through:

- Including all vehicles including implements of husbandry, special mobile machines, tractors and off-road vehicles
- Improving the Graduated Licensing Program in Manitoba, where there is now a zero blood alcohol content mandated for a minimum of the first five years of driving. Novice drivers who violate the zero blood alcohol concentration restriction may:
 - Receive at minimum an immediate 24-hour roadside suspension.
 - Be required to attend a Show Cause Hearing with Driver Improvement and Control to determine further sanctions.
 - Be required to pay a driver's licence reinstatement charge of \$50.
- All convicted offenders of impaired driving are subject to a **mandatory licence condition** requiring them to use an ignition interlock device ranging from 1 year to lifetime after the expiration of the mandatory suspension under the Highway Traffic Act. Impaired drivers who have conditional licences are also required to use an ignition interlock device. The device requires a breath sample from the driver and prevents the vehicle from being operated if alcohol is detected. Persons who drive without an

26 MADD.

27 The 2012 Provincial & Territorial Legislative Review March 2012 MADD Canada.

ignition interlock device during the time that they are required to do so may be charged with driving while disqualified, which, upon conviction, may result in a fine of up to \$5,000, a jail sentence of up to one year or both a fine and jail sentence.

- Towing costs, storage costs and a provincial impoundment fee must be paid by vehicle owners before their vehicles can be released. The approximate cost is \$450 for a 30-day impoundment and \$900 for a 90-day impoundment. Registered owners who were not driving when the vehicle was impounded may apply to have the vehicle released. Costs must still be paid before the vehicle is released.²⁸

These improvements have no doubt solidified Manitoba's keen interest in treating alcohol impaired driving as a serious issue.

Recommendation: *MPI should ensure that the advertising related to alcohol impaired driving is targeted at the appropriate audience, using the most appropriate medium. They should also ensure (through commitments from the Police) that there will be enhanced enforcement on the topic during the advertising periods. (International good practise suggests that advertising alone, (without any enforcement) is money wasted).*

It is further recommended that MPI have a discussion with ICBC as to the cost effectiveness of investing in enhanced enforcement focused on drinking and driving.

MPI should also monitor the way in which their grants and sponsorships are made, ensuring that this money is used to maximum effectiveness.

4.6.2 Distracted driving

(Budget for Cell phone/Distracted Driver Advertising:

2012/13 – Actual: \$183,000

2013/14 – Forecast: \$225,000)

According to MPI's website:

Using a hand-held cell phone while driving is not only against the law, it can have devastating consequences. In 2010, 31 people were killed in distracted driving collisions on Manitoba roadways.

Being distracted for a couple of seconds is all it takes to cause a fatal crash. Keep your focus on the road and do your part to help keep Manitoba's roads safe.

Distracted driving is a growing concern, especially among young drivers and statistics show that one in four deaths on Manitoba roads involved a distracted driver."

As of Aug. 1, 2013, Manitobans convicted of using a handheld device while driving receive two demerits, in addition to a \$200 fine.

Demerits affect your level on the Driver Safety Rating scale and can result in higher vehicle or driver's licence premiums.

28 Ministry of Justice – Manitoba website.

It is interesting to note that MPI paid for radio advertising in July/August 2013 related to the new sanctions (demerits) associated with distracted driving.²⁹ According to the Traffic Safety Plan Enforcement calendar the months for a focus on distracted driving are April and November. There perhaps could have been better coordination and management of this.

Recommendation: *MPI should ensure that the advertising related to distracted driving is targeted at the appropriate audience, using the most appropriate medium. They should also ensure (through commitments from the Police) that there will be enhanced enforcement on the topic during the advertising periods.*

4.6.2 Driver fatigue

MPI's website reports that

from 2006-2010, there were, on average, 108 fatigue-related crashes reported each year. Although fatigue-related collisions only account for 0.4 per cent of collisions, most road safety experts conclude that these crashes tend to be under-reported. The most dangerous hours in which fatigue-related collisions occur are between midnight to 9 a.m. (48 per cent) and noon to 6 p.m. (30 per cent)

While drowsy driving is featured on the 60-second driver tips it is unclear if there are any other programs focused on this topic.

For many provinces and territories the focus for this program has been on commercial vehicle drivers including long haul transport drivers and long distance bus drivers.

4.7 Community Relations/Grants

(Budget for Safety Grants and Sponsorships:

2012/13 – Actual: \$261,000

2013/14 – Forecast: \$262,000)

Manitoba Public Insurance will consider funding requests that support their core business interests, including road safety, medical rehabilitation, competitive insurance product sales, vehicle loss prevention and business partnerships. They also consider requests from organizations that promote quality of life in Manitoba through arts and culture, diversity, education, environmental health and major sporting events. Funding is usually directed to programs, organizations and events that operate at the provincial or regional level, or in the communities where claim centres are located.

In 2012/2013 MPI plans to spend \$227,000 on grants and sponsorships. There are some campaigns and projects that MPI will not fund. All requests for support are evaluated against the following general criteria:

Strategic fit

This grouping of evaluation criteria covers such things as, consistency with MPI's mission and values, does it further MPI's business goals and objectives; does it provide a cost-effective means of reaching the corporation's key target audiences; and, does it provide opportunities to demonstrate corporate citizenship and leadership.

29 CAC/CAA(MPI)2-8.

Organization / Event /Project

This is more about the requesting organization's fiscal and management responsibility to successfully execute its plans and monitor, evaluate and share the findings with MPI.

Employee and public support

This relates to the relevance of MPI's employees (i.e. will the project enhance employee morale, etc.)

According to MPI's response to CAC/CAA(MPI)2-7 they made a 3 year contribution of \$280,500 for advertising at the Winnipeg Football Club. The post-funding report apparently reported that the ROI (Return on Investment) had been realized as outlined in the agreement. It would be interesting to know the types of actions and processes that were evaluated.

Recommendation: *While generally this is not a lot of money, and some of the grants will be used to leverage partnership (and other) funding, it is essential that if this funding is coming from the Road Safety budget then the focus of the program should be solely focused on one of MPI's road safety priorities.*

4.8 Road safety advertising**(Budget for Road Safety Production and Advertising:****2012/13 – Actual: \$347,000****2013/14 – Forecast: \$360,000)**

In the MPI Rate Application, SM.5 Road Safety section, MPI reports that the 2014/2015 projected budget for road safety advertising and sponsorships is \$2,150,000 (18.6% of total budget). This includes various methods to reach a wide and varied audience, including the 60-second driver program, Winnipeg Free Press tips and CJOB radio, professional sporting sponsorships, partnerships with MADD and TADD and Safety Services Manitoba, for such programs as Operation Red Nose.

Through its website, MPI reports:

The Corporation's advertising campaigns are intended to create broad public awareness about the dangers and consequences of high risk driving behaviours such as impaired driving, speed and aggressive driving, non-use of occupant restraints and distracted driving. Advertising campaigns are also used to raise awareness about cycling safety, wildlife collisions, intersection safety, ATV and snowmobile safety and pedestrian safety. Advertising tactics include the use of TV, radio and outdoor advertising (billboards and transit buses/shelters) in Winnipeg and in select rural communities throughout Manitoba.

The 60-second driver program has been running for more than ten years and provides an ideal opportunity to convey important driving tips and road safety messages, which are aired during CTV newscasts to an estimated audience of 80,000 viewers. MPI also leverages its partnerships with the Winnipeg Free Press (Weekly Driving Tips) and CJOB radio.

In April 2013 MPI launched a province-wide multi-media campaign to raise awareness about the dangers of texting and driving – “Your last words”. Through its partnership with the Manitoba Association of Chiefs of Police, this month-long campaign was again accompanied by significant enforcement of Manitoba’s distracted driving legislation.

It is hoped that MPI utilised other forms of social media to reach their target audience!

Evaluating media campaigns

According to MPI’s website they

recognize that changing and maintaining social behaviour occurs over a long period of time. With this in mind, MPI reports that it does conduct extensive research to ensure the road safety messages reach target audiences, achieve communication objectives and **are effective**.

Through annual surveys MPI is able to measure Manitoban’s recall of a particular campaign and whether or not it influenced a change in driving behaviour. This kind of research assists MPI in enhancing and/or developing new road safety campaigns that hopefully in the future will be effective in reducing risk on Manitoba roads.

While “awareness” of an issue is the first step in behaviour change – in no way should it be considered as sufficient to bring about a change in behaviour. The best example of this is the issue of impaired driving, which has been the subject of mass media advertising for over 3 decades – but people still drink then drive!

The only meaningful way to evaluate campaigns is to undertake “before” and “after” campaign behaviour surveys and to repeat the “after” surveys at 6 month and 2 month intervals following the campaign.

Research in many countries has shown that a publicity campaign by itself has only a modest impact on attitudes and behaviour. Campaigns work best when combined with other interventions, such as enforcement of traffic laws and regulations, or provision of other safety services and products. A “behaviour change” campaign must include enforcement.

It is vital to evaluate the effectiveness of road safety campaigns. There should be a strong and obvious link between the evaluation to be conducted and the campaign objectives which must be measurable. Campaign evaluation is conducted at three stages to highlight strengths, weaknesses and lessons learned. The three stages are: formative evaluation (pre-campaign); process evaluation (during the campaign); and post-campaign. In most cases the overall objective will be to reduce crashes or casualties. There are also many intermediate measures that could be used. These may include:

- popular liking for a message;
- popular opinion of message effectiveness;
- expert opinion of message effectiveness;
- the numbers and types of road users reached;
- recall of the message used;
- change in traffic knowledge;
- change in attitudes;
- change in behaviour as reported by the individual;

- change in observed behaviour;
- change in violation rates; and
- change in crash rates.³⁰

Assessing changes in knowledge, attitude and behaviour targeted by a media campaign is an essential element of the evaluation process. There are many examples from across the globe of good evaluations of advertising campaigns. One of them is the “Evaluation of Foolsspeed Campaign” found at <http://www.scotland.gov.uk>.

4.9 Friends for Life Speaker Series

According to MPI’s website:

In 2011 MPI partnered with the Manitoba School Boards Association and TADD to introduce the Friends for Life speaker series in middle and senior high schools throughout Manitoba. This series which runs annually in the fall presents a mix of professional and local amateur speakers delivering presentations to Manitoba youth and sharing their own compelling stories about the risk and consequences of impaired driving and other unsafe behaviours.

In 2007 ICBC undertook an evaluation of its “RoadSense SpeakersTour” which is similar to the MPI program. It concluded that there was strong evidence of strong immediate impact on students, some impact on short term self-reported driving behaviour, as well as evidence for indirect impact on behaviour by virtue of reframing and amplifying the effect of enforcement such that fines and penalties are indicators of habits or choices that could lead to more serious consequences. Based on the available evidence attesting to the significant emotional and cognitive impact of the speakers on students, the Speaker Program appears to have generated more immediate and short-term impact than any other ICBC road safety educational tactic evaluated to date. As such, it was recommended that ICBC continue to support this program in the future.³¹

4.10 Planned Programs and initiatives for 2013/2014

MPI has produced a list of road safety and driver education programs and initiatives, which include:

- The High School Driver Education Program
- Driver Ed Challenge
- Citizens Bridge Adult Driver Education Program
- Support for VRU training programs and workshops through Safety Services Manitoba
- Road Watch
- Support for TADD and Safe Grad related initiatives
- Mock Car Collision
- Support for the PARTY program
- Support for Manitoba Addictions Awareness Week

30 VicRoads International Final Campaign Report Vietnam RS project 2012.

31 The RoadSense Speakers Tour Evaluation - Vavrik et al: June 2007.

- MADD Canada multi-media presentations in Manitoba schools
- Friends for Life Speaker Series and Northern Speaker Series
- Support for Report Impaired Drivers 911 program
- Operation Red Nose
- Rethink Road safety Youth Video Challenge
- Community based Speedwatch program
- Wildlife-related awareness initiatives
- Manitoba Child Car Seat program
- Citizens on Patrol program
- Manitoba Schools Patrol program
- Cycling safety initiatives
- Mini-Car Town, bicycle rodeos, etc.
- Collaboration with the Alzheimer's Society and the Transportation Options Network on alternative transportation for seniors
- Public and community presentations
- 60-Second driver
- Mass media advertising
- Integrated and Awareness and Enforcement Calendar
- Various corporate sponsorships.

It is also anticipated that these same programs would be continued in 2014/2015.

It is interesting to note that there are no plans for MPI to commission any studies on the impact of red light camera or photo radar.

A strategic approach to road safety would take a much closer review of all these programs and determine which should be the priorities - and do a few initiatives well. In road safety, MORE is not always BETTER!

4.11 Monitoring and evaluation of road safety programs

(Budget for Program Evaluation:

2012/13 – Actual: \$100,000

2013/14 – Forecast: \$110,000)

MPI reports that it does conduct post-program evaluation on all road safety programs to measure the program effectiveness, the extent to which the road safety programs reached their target audiences and whether the program is achieving the learning objectives. It also attempts to capture the participant's recall of the program messages and learning outcomes and whether or not it influenced a change in safety behaviour.

In a typical year, the advertising research includes one topical focus group research study consisting of about six focus group sessions and one post-campaign evaluation to ensure the message reaches the target audience. It is important to remember that each road safety program and each target audience requires a unique advertising strategy that is sensitive to the demographic and socio-economic context of their audience and the targeted behaviour.

Section 4.11 further discusses the importance of evaluating media campaigns. Section 2.3.9 contains further information about the monitoring and evaluation process.

The Traffic Injury Prevention Foundation have undertaken monitoring and evaluation of many road safety issues and programs both in Canada and Internationally. These can be found on their website www.tirf.ca.

A discussion of many additional programs which are funded by MPI can be found in Appendix E.

4.12 Summary of MPI Road Safety Programs

While MPI *spends* its road safety budget on a wide variety of road safety issues, there is a lack of evidence that most of them have made any difference in reducing the frequency and severity of collisions on Manitoba roads. This should be a concern for all. MPI should in fact be “*investing*” in road safety programs that will in fact return a positive benefit to those investments, through fewer road collisions, leading to fewer insurance claims.

As reported elsewhere in this report, good practice jurisdictions have identified a few key road safety issues and then developed a fully coordinated and strategic approach to address them. (See section 2.3.3)

Other weaknesses have been identified which need to be addressed:

1. The whole road safety program is not strategic in nature in that the programs (and partners) lack coordination.
2. There is very little evidence of any ongoing monitoring and evaluation of these programs to ensure they are being effective.
3. While the legislative components of most of the programs are comparable with other provinces and territories, it is not clear whether there are aggressive and focused enforcement to support them, which may make them fall short of good practice.
4. Many of the programs are supported by quality information brochures and guidelines on the MPI website but, while this might provide information, it is probably not enough to create sustained behaviour change.

In 2007 ICBC conducted a comprehensive review of its investment in education and awareness programs as part of a much broader review of all its road safety investments. This review took into consideration good practice from other jurisdictions that indicate that the most successful road user programs focus on enforceable consequences and that conducting education and awareness tactics in isolation is ineffective. As a result ICBC discontinued eight road safety programs that included only education and awareness tactics without an enforcement component. After determining the road safety programs that will be supported, ICBC established measurable objectives for each program.

It is vital that MPI examines its programs regularly, asking:

- Is this program cost effective?
- Are there other initiatives that might provide more cost effective results?
- Given the program priorities, identified through the collision data – Is this the most efficient use of scarce resources, both financial and human?

4.13 Additional Road Safety Program for consideration

The 2011 Traffic Collision Statistics Report identifies a high death rate from traffic collisions on rural roads. In 2011 while **urban areas** account for 77% of all collisions in Manitoba, they only account for 34% of fatal collisions. **Rural areas** however account for only 23% of all collisions but 66% of all fatal collisions. The report also reports that this is consistent with historical data.

This should prompt MPI to take a closer look at fatal and serious injury collisions on rural roads. Some questions might be:

- What types of vehicles are involved – Commercial, long haul transport, buses, cars, motorcycles?
- Are there any locations that might be termed “black-spots”?
- What is the road configuration – are they on 2-lane roads or 4-lane divided highways?
- What is the speed limit in the location?
- What is the average travel speed along the highway?
- What other contributing factor are there – driver (Impaired/distracted/fatigued/buckled up), vehicle condition, weather conditions, presence of wildlife, etc?

A good approach to dealing with rural road collisions is to take a “Corridor-wide” approach. Improving safety along the corridor is likely to be more effective than just treating specific locations. Ultimately an integrated, multi-faceted approach will be required that will involve many partners. This approach has proven to be effective on many rural highways in the US. Information can be found at the Federal Highways Administration (FHWA) website at <http://www.fhwa.dot.gov/>

In addition to the recommended program focused on rural roads, consideration should be given to the development of a separate strategy focused on the Aboriginal community. The Province of Manitoba website indicates an aboriginal community of 175,000 living either on or off reserve and a Metis community, and this figure seems to be rising. More importantly, 60% of the aboriginal community are under the age of 30. For this reason it is recommended that injuries from traffic collisions involving First Nations people are reviewed. In the early stages of the development of the Alberta Traffic Safety Plan it was realised that a special and more focused approach towards First Nations is required. Consequently, in full consultation with the aboriginal communities, Alberta Transportation developed the Alberta Aboriginal Traffic Safety Plan. For more information please refer to Appendix F.

Chapter 5 – Conclusions

Manitoba Public Insurance seems to be at a crossroads!

Their road safety budget is inadequate to effectively address all the issues that they have identified. At the same time there does not appear to having been much prioritization undertaken as to what should be their key focus. In fact it might be argued that budgets are being used in some areas, to the detriment of making greater progress on the key issues, such as impaired driving, speeding and the use of occupant restraints. All agencies,

especially government partners are challenged to do more with less which is why the business of road safety is the business of all Manitobans.

A more strategic and integrated approach is required if there is a keen desire for change. There needs to be a breaking down of the “silos” as government and non-government agencies together with municipal governments, businesses and the public work together in a spirit of coordination and collaboration under the auspices of a lead agency. In fact Manitobans have already spoken about their support for MPI to take on this leadership role during the Public Consultation process.

Throughout this document and the Appendices, recommendations are made that address; a strategic approach to road safety; the importance of having a vision, targets and performance measures to ensure that sustained progress is made; targeted advertising and the importance of evaluating campaigns and indeed for the campaigns to be focused on enforceable actions.

Appendix A - Average Collision Cost Values³²

Two sources of collision data were used for this evaluation of ICBC's Road Improvement Program, including:

1. Claims-based incident data, which was obtained from the Business Intelligence Unit (BIU) at ICBC; and,
2. Police-reported incident data, which was obtained from the Highway Accident System (HAS) at the Ministry of Transportation (MOT).

Claim-based incident records are very useful for the examination of urban intersections when the location of an incident can be accurately located. The claim-based incident records can also be very useful for urban roadways that have many location identifiers, such as street addresses, that can be used by a reporting claimant to identify the exact location of a collision. However, for rural highways, the claim-based incident data is not very useful due to the inability of a claimant to identify the precise location of an incident on a section of highway that has very few location references.

For example, if an incident occurs on the Trans Canada Highway (Highway 1) between the communities of Hope and Chilliwack, the claimant reporting the incident to ICBC will have difficulty in identifying the precise location. The claimant might state that the incident occurred about 10 kilometers west of Hope, but this level of precision for the location is not adequate for the engineering analysis that is completed as part of the Road Improvement Program. Due to this problem, the claims-based incident data is not used for the analysis of road improvement projects on provincial highways.

Since the Ministry of Transportation is a significant and effective partner to the Road Improvement Program, it is necessary to use an alternate collision data source for the requisite analysis. The Ministry's Highway Accident System (HAS) is used, since it uses a system known as the Landmark Kilometer Inventory system (LKI) that the police use to identify the location of an incident. The LKI system can accurately locate the location of a collision to a level of precision of 100 meters. Furthermore, since the collisions are police-reported, there are many details concerning the incidents, such as causal factors and roadway design / operational details that are helpful in engineering analysis. Also, it is suggested that the potential for bias and/or errors in the reporting process is less for a police official (HAS data) as compared to a self-reported incident (claims data). Since there is a difference in the two collision data processes, there is also a difference in the amount of data. The claims-based incident data is significantly more than the police reported data, which is true for all locations, not just provincial highways. This is due to the fact that someone involved in an incident will very likely go to ICBC to report the incident and then have his or her vehicle repaired. In contrast, the police cannot attend every collision due to resource limitations and the logistical difficulties associated with 100% attendance. Because of the differences in the data sets, it is necessary to reflect this difference in the average collision cost.

To determine the differences between the two collision data sets and to calculate the average collision cost, the data was obtained from the BIU and from HAS for incidents that occur on

32 2009 Program Evaluation Report, Road Improvement Program: www.icbc.com.

“highways”. The data is shown below in Tables E.1 for severe incidents (Fatal + Injury) and in Table E.2 for PDO incidents.

The collision data is provided for the years 2004 through to 2006, which match the years used in the evaluation. The frequency of claims-based data for each severity level is compared to the frequency of HAS data and a ratio is calculated for each year and then averaged over the time period. For severe incidents, this ratio is 1.878 and for PDO incidents, the ratio is 3.961. Then, using the average claim-based incident costs, which are \$31,385 for severe incidents and \$2,708 for PDO incidents, an average HAS-based incident costs can be calculated.

Appendix B - Manitoba's Graduated Driver License

To obtain a licence to operate a passenger vehicle in Manitoba, there are three GDL stages: Learner Licence (Class 5L); Novice Licence (Class 5I); and Full Licence (Class 5F). The program came into effect on January 1 2003. It comprises:

AGE REQUIREMENTS

Minimum entry age: 16 years, 15 yrs. and 6 months if enrolled in high school driver education course
Minimum exit age

ENTRY REQUIREMENTS

Driver education: Voluntary Knowledge test
Parental consent: If driver is under 18
Vision test

EXIT REQUIREMENTS

Successfully passed test/course: Class 5 road test
Time completion: Hold Class 5L licence for 9 months

STAGE DURATION

Minimum duration: 9 months
Maximum holding period: No maximum time periods for Learner stage as long as licence remains valid; if licence allowed to lapse for >4 years, then driver must re-write the knowledge exam

SUPERVISORY DRIVER

Age
BAC level while supervising: <0.05 BAC
Driver log
Licence held: Minimum Class 5
Location while supervising: Seated in the front seat
Time Licensed: At least 3 years

SUPERVISED DRIVING

Minimum amount of supervised driving: 9 months

DRIVING RESTRICTIONS AND CONDITIONS

BAC level while driving: 0.0 BAC
Display "L" sign/plate when driving
Night driving
Other restrictions
Passenger restrictions: Limited to one supervising driver in the front seat, and number of working seatbelts in backseat only
Road restrictions: Not permitted to operate Class 3 vehicle (farm truck) or off-road vehicle along or across highways

SUSPENSION & PROHIBITION

Lower driver penalty point threshold

Violation of the zero BAC limit: Any driver in the GDL program who violates the zero-BAC requirement or any other GDL restrictions will be faced with interventions and possible sanctions depending on the circumstances
Violation of any GDL restrictions: New drivers will be required to attend a Novice Driver Hearing with Driver Improvement and Control Section of Driver and Vehicle Licensing (see Drive Improvement Action section below for details); and may also be required to attend a Novice Driver Hearing as a result of convictions or accident involvement (see DRIVER IMPROVEMENT ACTIONS section)

DRIVER IMPROVEMENT ACTIONS

Novice Driver Hearing: At the hearing, the Reviewing Officer will review the nature and circumstances of the incidences with the driver. Results of the Hearing may include:

- A licence suspension
- An extension of the learner or novice stage
- A special driving course
- Passenger restrictions
- Time of day restrictions
- Other driving restrictions

Drivers may appeal the licence suspension, restricted or stage extension to the Licence Suspension Appeal Board on the grounds of hardship.

NOVICE DRIVERS ESCALATING SANCTIONS PROGRAM:

- 1st intervention – Novice Warning letter
- 2nd intervention – Novice Driver Course
- 3rd intervention – Novice Driver Hearing

ADDITIONAL CLASS 5L FEATURES

Drivers may apply for a motorcycle Class 6 Learner licence, but may not apply for authorized instruction in Classes 1-4 (commercial)

May operate a moped if the driver is at least 16 years of age

Not allowed to: tow vehicles; operate Class 3 motor vehicles registered as a farm truck; operate off-road vehicles along or across highways (unless driver holds a Minimum Class 6 Intermediate Stage Licence).³³

33 Traffic Injury Research Foundation.

Referencing the Traffic Collision Statistics Report for 2011 there were 22,867 licensed drivers in the age group 16-17. These are distributed as follows:

License Class	Male	Female	Total	
	Active	Suspended	Active	Suspended
5/F – Full class 5 license (including Full Stage Class 5 under GDL)	723	6	606	3
5/I – Intermediate Stage under GDL	5,288	53	4,631	12
5/L – Learner Stage under GDL	5,555	41	5,904	42
5/A – Learner drivers not in GDL	1	0	2	0
Total	22,867			

Manitoba's Graduated Driver License Program includes new *motorcycle riders*.

The Class 6 Driver Licence Stages are:

M – [Motorcycle Training Course Stage](#) – permits operation of a motorcycle while taking the motorcycle training course only

L – [Learner Stage](#)

I – [Intermediate Stage](#)

F – [Full Stage](#)

Each stage has specific restrictions imposed on the new driver that will reduce the opportunity and likelihood for them to engage in risky driving behaviour.

Time within the Learner and Intermediate Stages is only earned if the driver holds a valid licence. The driver will not earn credit for time served in the stage if their licence is suspended, prohibited or expired.

Prior to obtaining a Motorcycle Learner Licence, first-time motorcycle applicants must complete an approved Motorcycle Training Course. On the successful completion of the knowledge test you will be issued a motorcycle M Stage licence that will allow you take the Motorcycle Training Course only.

The Motorcycle Training Course is an approved one-day practical course that will provide the new motorcyclist with the basic skills required to operate a motorcycle. It is a user pay course offered at designated locations throughout the province.

Appendix C – Commentary on the July 2011 TIRF Evaluation

In July 2011 the Traffic Injury Research Foundation completed an:

Evaluation of the Photo Enforcement Safety program of the City of Winnipeg”. This included a review of the Intersection safety cameras and the mobile radar (speed enforcement). One of the conclusions was “The use of mobile photo radar cameras is an integral part of Winnipeg's Photo Enforcement Program. Therefore, data were collected to also evaluate this aspect of the Program. **Unfortunately, due to limitations of the data it was impossible to draw any meaningful conclusions about the effectiveness of these mobile radar cameras.** It is recommended that efforts are made to improve data collection in a follow-up study to enable the evaluation of this aspect of the Program.

One area that should be brought to the attention of MPI and indeed acted on as part of their advertising and awareness initiatives are the three “*Recommendations from the Public Opinion Poll*” which are identified in the TIRF report:

Recommendation 1 - Ensure levels of concern about road safety and speeding are appropriate. It may be possible to increase the program's effectiveness by increasing support for the program. Ways of increasing support for the program were investigated in this study using a multivariate analysis into the profile of people in favor of the continuation of the program versus those who are against the continuation of the program. Several dimensions were identified that hold promise in terms of increasing support for the program. First, raising levels of concern about road safety in general and speeding in particular can serve as a lever to increase support for the program as it was found that being more concerned goes hand in hand with being more supportive of the program. Vanlaar et al. (2008) have previously identified several ways to affect levels of concern in order to encourage people to take action or become more involved. For example, if people believe that others are concerned about the issue, this will increase their own level of concern (this is known as “the bandwagon effect”); or, if people understand the risks associated with speeding and red-light running, they will likely become more concerned about it. According to the results of the current study, the expectation would be that the increased level of concern would then lead to a higher level of support for the continuation of the program. This would presumably result in more people abiding by the rules with less speeding and red-light running infractions as a result.

Recommendation 2 - Continue to educate those who are less supportive of the photo enforcement safety program about how it improves road safety. Second, if you can convince those who are less supportive that Winnipeg's photo enforcement safety program helps improve road safety and makes the public more aware of the issue of speeding, levels of support for the continuation of the program among them would likely rise. This begs the question how those people who are against the continuation of the program can be convinced of its virtues. To this end, a strategy could be developed based on social marketing research findings regarding strategies to make people understand how risky these behaviours are and showing that the majority of people truly are concerned about these issues. Other potential dimensions of interest include the magnitude of the problem. People may underestimate the true

magnitude of the problem so if they would understand what the true extent of the problem is, they may no longer underestimate it and become more concerned about it as a result; this would in turn lead to higher levels of support for the program.

Recommendation 3 - Convince offenders that their behaviour is dangerous. It may also be useful to ensure that people who are caught and received a ticket — primarily for speeding although logic dictates the same would be true for running red lights — understand their behaviour is dangerous. It was found that having been caught and received a ticket influences the level of support. More precisely, among those who have been caught, support for the continuation of the program is lower. To actually make this subgroup aware of their dangerous behaviour may require a tailored approach because they may be less receptive of general social marketing strategies. Perhaps it could be investigated if and how this subgroup could be encouraged to be more cognizant of the risks they impose on other road users because of their behaviour. If they would understand why they are being sanctioned they may better appreciate the consequences and would perhaps become more supportive. As a sidebar, it is likely not impossible that at least a portion of them would become supportive, as suggested by the finding that 74% of those who were caught indeed actually are supportive of the program. On the other hand, it is acknowledged that not all people who committed infractions will be receptive to such a strategy. There will always be persistent offenders with whom such a rational approach would not work. The results from this study confirm this as several respondents indicated they were caught for speeding and running red lights at least three times, indicative of persistent or 'hard-core' offenders.³⁴

34 Evaluation of the Photo enforcement safety program of the city of Winnipeg: final report – July 2011.

Appendix D – Drinking and Driving Programs

RoadWatch

RoadWatch is based on a partnership between Manitoba Public Insurance and law enforcement agencies. The main objective of the program is to reduce impaired driving by increasing the perceived risk of arrest.

Studies prove that drivers respond not only to enforcement, but also to the threat of enforcement. The driver's perception of added risk--getting caught in a random check stop--is often enough to change their behaviour.

Participating police agencies provide increased random police check stops throughout Manitoba to deter drinking and driving and take impaired drivers off the road. These check stops are in addition to regularly scheduled enforcement.³⁵

Report Impaired Drivers (RID) 911

This program has now been adopted by the cities of Brandon, Thompson and Portage la Prairie. During the first year of the program, the Brandon Police Service reported a 47% increase in citizen calls to report suspected impaired drivers. Interceptions by police increased by 79% over the same period and when combined with warning letters issued to vehicle owners, resulted in police action being taken on 48.6% of all calls received. Total impaired driving charges or roadside suspensions originating from citizen calls also increased by 48.8% with the majority of these (78%) attracting Criminal Code charges.³⁶

This is a very good example of a partnership with the community, police and MPI working together. Similar success stories have been reported in British Columbia and Alberta.

Operation Red Nose

Operation Red Nose makes Manitoba roads safer during the holiday season by offering free rides home for those who may have had too much holiday cheer. Supported by the Manta Swim Club in partnership with Manitoba Public Insurance, and hosted by Safety Services Manitoba, the program services Arborg/Riverton, Brandon, Flin Flon, Gimli, Portage la Prairie, Selkirk, Shilo, The Pas, Thompson and Winnipeg.

Operation Red Nose operates during peak evenings and weekends in November and December. Last year in Manitoba, over 2,100 volunteers provided party goers with over 3,700 rides home. As the provincial funding sponsor, Manitoba Public Insurance supports operational expenses for host organizations.³⁷

Sponsorships

³⁵ MPI Website.

³⁶ MPI Website.

³⁷ MPI Website.

Manitoba Public Insurance sponsors the Manitoba School Board Association (MSBA) to oversee and coordinate the Safe Grad and Teens Against Drinking and Driving programs (TADD).³⁸

Safe Grad

Before Safe Grad was created over 30 years ago, provincial agencies, schools, city police, ambulance services, hospital emergency wards and parents faced the end of June with uneasiness as tragedies resulting from high school graduation continued to increase. There were several grad-night incidents that resulted in fatalities, automobile collisions, boating-related injuries and alcohol-related driving charges.³⁹

Teens Against Drinking and Driving

The [Manitoba Teens Against Drinking and Driving \(TADD\)](#) chapter began when graduating high school students asked for help in educating younger students (grades 9-11) about the dangers of drinking and driving.

TADD is now a well-established voluntary association of high school teens. They encourage all students not to drink and drive by sponsoring a number of school events that raise youth awareness of the issue.⁴⁰

P.A.R.T.Y. Program

Manitoba Public Insurance is a sponsor of P.A.R.T.Y., which stands for Prevent Alcohol and Risk-related Trauma in Youth. It's a hard-hitting, "tell it like it is" program that educates 15 to 25 year olds about the consequences of drinking and driving, not using seatbelts and other risky driving behaviour.⁴¹

38 MPI Website.

39 MPI Website.

40 MPI Website.

41 MPI Website; please note that previous formal evaluations of the PARTY program in Edmonton and Calgary have been inconclusive as to the real benefits of this program.

Appendix E – Additional Programs Funded by MPI

4.7 Vulnerable Road Users

(Budget for Vulnerable Road Users Education:

2012/13 – Actual: \$135,000

2013/14 – Forecast: \$213,000)

According to the Canadian Council of Motor Transport Administrators (CCMTA) Vulnerable Road User Strategy:

issues such as poor roads and high population densities are often cited as factors that contribute to the casualty rate among vulnerable road users in developed and underdeveloped countries alike. These factors are not really a problem in Canada. As an extremely large and highly developed country, Canada has one of the highest per capita vehicle ownership rates in the world. Not surprisingly, almost 80% of all road user casualties are motor vehicle occupants.

Vulnerable road users make up the remaining 24% of road users killed and seriously injured each year in traffic crashes. In 2006, 665 vulnerable road users were killed and 3,667 were seriously injured. Pedestrians comprised the largest group of victims among vulnerable road user casualties, accounting for 56% of fatally injured victims and 50% of those with serious injuries. Motorcycle or moped riders accounted for 33% of fatalities and 36% of seriously injured victims, and cyclists comprised the remaining 11% of fatally injured and 14% of seriously injured crash victims.

In Manitoba pedestrians and motorcyclists/mopeds account for a much higher proportion of people killed and seriously injured than they represent among all victims in traffic collisions.

As reported in the Traffic Collision Statistics Report 2011:

5. In terms of people killed in traffic collisions, “Drivers” account for the largest proportion in 2011 at nearly 54%, followed by motor vehicle “Passengers” at 30%, “Pedestrians” at 9% and “Bicyclists” and “Motorcyclist/Mopeds” both at nearly 4%.
6. In terms of people seriously injured in traffic collisions, “Drivers” account for the largest proportion in 2011 at nearly 54%, followed by motor vehicle “Passengers” at 29%, “Motorcyclist/Mopeds” at 9% and “Pedestrians” at 7% and “Cyclists” at 1.8%.
7. “Pedestrians” account for more than twice the proportion of people killed as they do for victims overall in 2011.
8. “Motorcyclist/Mopeds” account for more than twice the proportion of people killed as they do for victims overall in 2011.

4.7.1 Pedestrian safety

In Manitoba during 2011, there were 340 pedestrians killed or injured in traffic collisions. Of these:

- 10 were killed
- 24 were seriously injured
- 130 sustained minor injuries

- 62 sustained minimal injuries, and
- 114 sustained injuries that were undefined in terms of severity.

The total number of pedestrians killed and injured in traffic collisions in 2011 has decreased by 15% compared to 2010 and by nearly 22% compared to the previous five years (2006-2010) annual average.

As reported on the MPI website, in order to provide safer routes to school for children and minimize their involvement in collisions, MPI is a supporting partner of the School Safety Patrol program in Manitoba, which is spearheaded by the Canadian Automobile Association (CAA). [CAA Manitoba](#) helps organize the program and, with the contributions of other program partners, provides all materials - flags, vests, booklets and more - at no cost to participating schools.

Manitoba Public Insurance makes a key contribution to the program by helping purchase high-visibility safety vests for the youngsters and by producing the School Safety Patrol Handbook”.

Please see section 4.5 above with reference to implementing slower speed limits in areas of high pedestrian activity, as recommended in the Safe System Approach.

4.7.2 Bicycle safety

MPI’s website reports that
in Manitoba:

- On average, three cyclists are killed and more than 250 are injured each year.
- Almost 65 per cent of collisions that involve bicycles and motor vehicles occur at intersections.
- Right and left turns contribute to almost 10 per cent of cycling injury claims.
- More than 20 per cent of cycling injury claims involve cyclists riding on sidewalks and crossing an intersection from the sidewalk.
- Cyclists in the 10 to 14 age group are the most likely to be killed or injured.
- More than 70 per cent of cyclists killed or injured in a collision with a vehicle were not wearing a helmet.
- Collisions with vehicles occur most frequently during heavy traffic times of the day with roughly 80 per cent occurring on a week day and 30 per cent during afternoon rush hour (between 3 p.m. and 6 p.m.)

Claims reports suggest that fault for bicycle-motor vehicle collisions is often shared between drivers and cyclists. There are many causes for these collisions including not following the rules of the road, failing to yield the right of way and motorists failing to see the cyclist or squeezing cyclists to the edge of the road. This is why a multi-prong approach is required. This should include awareness for cyclist and drivers of their responsibility and the need to share the road and the provision of safer infrastructure.

Manitoba Public Insurance’s website contains a good amount of information about cycling and road safety.

MPI also reports that:

it assists in the delivery of a broad cycling safety promotion campaign as part of the Province's three year action plan on Active Transportation. This advertising campaign will encourage both cyclists and motorists to share the road safely. Consultation took place with a local advocacy group "Bike to the Future (BtF)". The campaign includes radio and transit advertising in addition to existing advertising channels.

The Safe System Approach emphasizes the need to design comprehensive safety initiatives that incorporate the key elements of the transport system e.g. safer roads, safer speeds, safer users and safer vehicles. The underpinning principle of SSA is that the transport system must be designed to accommodate human errors and therefore minimize the risk of injury occurrence as well as the severity of injuries, should crashes occur. The **Ottawa Charter for Health Promotion** provides a comprehensive framework that can be used to address various areas related to bicycle safety. The key components of the **Ottawa Charter for Health Promotion** are: building healthy public policy (e.g. legislation, organizational change etc.), creating supportive environments, strengthening community actions (e.g. empowering communities in setting health priorities and developing solutions); developing personal skills and reorienting health services (e.g. promoting health beyond provision of only clinical/curative services).

For additional information go to <http://www.phac-aspc.gc.ca>

4.7.3 Motorcycle safety

(Budget for Motorcycle Safety Education:

2012/13 – Actual: \$108,000

2013/14 – Forecast: \$98,000)

According to MPI's website:

In Manitoba, motorcycles (including scooters and mopeds) have the lowest relative rate of involvement in traffic collisions among all vehicle types both in 2011 and in the previous five years (2006-2010) annual average – 18%. In 2011, motorcycles have a relative involvement rate of 1.8 in fatal collisions. In the previous five years (2006-2010) annual average, motorcycles had a vehicle involvement rate of 2.9 in fatal collisions.

Additional information about Manitoba's Graduated Driver License Program can be found in Appendix B.

MPI also reports that with their support, Safety Services Manitoba has expanded its motorcycle safety training to include an advanced riding program (**Experienced Rider Program**) to respond to the needs of experienced riders who are seeking training on advanced riding skills or motorcyclists who have had no formal training or who are returning to the sport after a break from riding.

Manitoba Public Insurance's website contains a good amount of information about motorcycling and road safety.

4.7.4 Older drivers

MPI's website reports that:

of all people killed in traffic collisions in 2011, those aged 65 and older make up the largest group (22%). In 2011, drivers in the youngest and oldest age groups account for a higher proportion of fatal traffic collisions than they do injury and PDO collisions. Compared to the previous 5 year (2006-2010) annual average, drivers aged 65 and older increased by 17% for total collisions, up 17% for fatal collisions, up nearly 12% for injury collisions, and up more than 18% for PDO collisions.

Statisticians are predicting a large increase in the population of seniors over the next few decades. In 2010, just fewer than 117,000 Manitobans aged 65 years and older had a valid driver's licence. In keeping with Statistics Canada population projections, this segment of drivers could rise to approximately 161,000 by 2021 and 226,000 by 2036.

Manitoba Public Insurance's website contains a good amount of information about older drivers and road safety.

4.8 Auto crime

(Budget for Auto-crime Prevention strategies:

2012/13 – Actual: \$4,190,000

2013/14 – Forecast: \$4,046,000)

According to MPI:

approximately 26% of MPI's total annual road safety budget for 2014/2015 (\$2.96 million) will be used towards program and initiatives to reduce auto crime in Manitoba.

Challenges

Over the last two decades, Manitoba has struggled to reverse a rapid rise in auto theft. In 2004 about 30 vehicles were stolen every day in Manitoba. More than 80 per cent of them were in Winnipeg.

This high theft rate had a price.

In 2004, thefts and attempted thefts cost Manitobans roughly \$43 million in insurance claims.

Manitoba's auto theft problem is unique

In other parts of Canada, newer, more expensive vehicles are stolen for profit by career criminals. In Manitoba, auto theft continues to be a crime of opportunity that's difficult to combat through law enforcement alone. Winnipeg police also report stolen vehicles are being used in other crimes.

High risk vehicles

Some vehicles are easier to steal than others. Manitoba Public Insurance identified those in its Most at Risk (MaR) list and owners are required to immobilize these vehicles. In April 2006 MPI started offering immobilizers to owners of MaR vehicles at no cost—an extreme move in response to an extreme problem. They continue to offer immobilizers at reduced cost to all customers with unprotected vehicles.

In 2006 the provincial government also introduced a regulation requiring immobilizers be installed in vehicles that were last registered outside of the province. The regulations also made immobilizers mandatory in MaR vehicles involved in a theft claim.

In September 2007 immobilizers became mandatory in Most-at-Risk vehicles registered for use in, or to commute to, Winnipeg—vehicles that have proven to be consistent targets of thieves. The provincial regulation came into effect at the same time as new Transport Canada regulations that require all vehicles manufactured for sale in Canada after September 1, 2007 to have an immobilizer as standard equipment.

The federal and provincial strategies have worked together to reduce auto theft in Manitoba. While the federal strategy protects newer vehicles with factory installed immobilizers, the provincial strategy uses aftermarket immobilizers to protect older vehicles.

Manitoba has taken a multi-pronged approach to decrease the theft rate.

The long-term core solution is **immobilizer laws and incentives** to protect high-risk vehicles. **Monitoring and enforcement** help to bring the theft rate under control as the immobilizer program grows. **Other solutions** are increased monitoring of auto theft and encouraging our young people to do better things with their lives.

In addition to the immobilizer assistance program **The Winnipeg Auto Theft Suppression Strategy (WATSS)** is a partnership between Manitoba Public Insurance, Manitoba Justice and the Winnipeg Police Service that targets chronic and repeat young offenders. This strict **monitoring and curfew program** includes mandatory daily interviews for the worst offenders and checks as frequent as every three hours for the highest level offenders when not incarcerated. If participants fail to comply, the province and police will move immediately to arrest them and seek their incarceration from the courts. The Winnipeg Police Service plays a key role in dealing with youth at all levels, particularly those at highest risk. The program has been focused on Winnipeg, where more than 80 per cent of auto thefts were occurring. As of 2011, thefts in Winnipeg represented 72 per cent of provincial thefts. Manitoba Public Insurance provides funding to hire corrections staff and cover operating costs on top of existing investments by the Winnipeg Police Service and Manitoba Justice. (This is a good example for the Winnipeg Police Service, perhaps that other departments, such as traffic, could replicate.)

To assist law enforcement in their efforts, MPI also:

- coordinates the [Citizens on Patrol Program \(COPP\)](#), which mobilizes community volunteers to be additional eyes and ears for local police;
- provides more than \$600,000 in annual funding to help the Winnipeg Police Service dedicate a team of seven investigators to auto theft;
- provides over \$100,000 in annual funding for two Crown prosecutors to ensure that auto thieves are held accountable in the courts; and

- provides additional resources for auto theft investigation in partnership with the RCMP, the City of Brandon Police and other municipal police.

The result of the focused effort on auto theft in the City of Winnipeg is that auto thefts have now declined 85% since 2004. Across the province, the combined total and attempted thefts continue to be the lowest since 1992 and are 82% lower than in 2006 when this combined total peaked. In 2012 specifically, there was a combined reduction of 2.4% in total and attempted thefts compared to 2011. The Winnipeg Police Service reports that in 2012, the average number of vehicles stolen daily was 3.8, approximately one-sixth of the number stolen in 2004 when an average of 24 vehicles were stolen every day.

Since 2004 MPI has spent approximately \$88.3million and saved over \$200million as a result of their auto theft efforts.

This has been a very good example of identifying a serious problem, planning and implementing a multi-pronged approach to address the problem and monitoring and evaluating the results.

4.9 Collisions with wildlife

On average, there are about 6,800 vehicle-deer collisions each year in Manitoba, according to the Manitoba Public Insurance claims data.

- Last year in Manitoba more than 300 people were injured in wildlife-related collisions.
- Over the last 10 years, three people in Manitoba have been killed in crashes caused by an animal on a road.
- In 2011, 14% of all collisions (1% fatal, nearly 4% injury and 16% PDO) were the result of the actions of a wild animal.
- In considering the contributing factors recorded for collisions where people are killed or seriously injured in 2011, the actions of a wild animal were in last place (of 12 other factors) - 1% of people killed and 2% people seriously injured.

Costs of Wildlife Collision Claims (2003-2012)			
	Bodily Injury Claims Costs	Physical Damage Claims costs	
Year of Loss	Fatal Claims costs	Injury Claims costs	Total BI Claims costs
2003	-	4,684,942	4,684,942
2004	-	2,448,597	2,448,597
2005	317,368	934,561	1,251,929
2006	-	2424,552	2,424,552
2007	-	2,209,017	2,209,017
2008	7,255	2,931,252	2,938,507
2009	-	2874,883	2,874,883
2010	-	2,007,698	2,007,698
2011	62,773	2,114,498	2,177,271
2012	145,705	1,551,284	1,696,989
Totals	533,101	24,181,283	24,714,384

In an effort to provide drivers with greater information about the locations of wildlife-vehicle collisions MPI publishes deer-vehicle collision maps that identify collision hot spot locations within Winnipeg and throughout rural Manitoba.

Manitoba Public Insurance's website contains a good amount of information about wildlife – vehicle collisions.

In August 2012 the Traffic Injury Research Foundation completed a report “*WILDLIFE-VEHICLE COLLISIONS IN CANADA: A REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE AND A COMPENDIUM OF EXISTING DATA SOURCES*”. This report is the first deliverable of a feasibility study to create a centralized Wildlife-Vehicle Collision (WVC) clearinghouse in Canada. Its goals were to justify the creation of such a clearinghouse by describing the magnitude of the problem. As such, a literature review was conducted. From the literature review it became clear that the problem of WVCs is not an insignificant one as there are considerable socio-economic, traffic safety and environmental consequences. The literature review also made clear that the available data today are too limited to accurately measure the impact of WVCs and to properly inform mitigation measures.

In conclusion, this report serves as the basis for the next step in this project, which will be to conduct a feasibility study and to develop an action plan for the creation of a centralized clearinghouse.⁴²

Many of the provinces and territories have undertaken a variety of initiatives, in partnership with conservation and wildlife groups, to try and mitigate this issue ranging from fencing, tunnels, overpasses, roadside reflectors and the use of Intelligent Transport Systems, such as advanced driver information systems and dynamic message signs – none of which really seem to have been 100% effective.

42 www.tirf.ca.

What is known is that drivers (and passengers) need to be made aware of WHEN and WHERE wildlife are likely to be close to or on the road and that their best defence against a collision and any subsequent injuries is to reduce their speed and for all occupants to wear their seat belts.

Appendix F – Developing Alberta’s Aboriginal Traffic Safety Strategy

Aboriginal Traffic Safety Strategy Alberta Traffic Safety Community Mobilization

1. Introduction

Alberta’s Traffic Safety Plan: Saving Lives on Alberta’s Roads

The Alberta government has taken on the challenge of improving traffic safety by moving ahead with a comprehensive, made-in-Alberta Traffic Safety Plan. The success of this plan will only be achieved through the continued efforts of many traffic safety stakeholders. It will be designed to engage individuals, communities, municipalities, and industry and stakeholder organizations as partners.

Alberta’s Traffic Safety Plan: Saving Lives on Alberta’s Roads (TSP) is a comprehensive strategy designed to reduce traffic-related deaths and injuries in the province. It outlines key initiatives to help prevent motor vehicle collisions, build safer roads, establish and enforce traffic laws, and better educate all Albertans about traffic safety.

The TSP was developed in response to the McDermid Report, *Saving Lives on Alberta’s Roads: Report and Recommendations for a Traffic Collision Fatality and Injury Reduction Strategy*. The McDermid Report was the result of an independent review of the government’s traffic safety programs aimed at finding the most effective ways to change driver habits and reduce collisions.

The TSP supports Canada’s national road safety plan, *Road Safety Vision 2010*. The plan contains an overall ambitious, quantitative target, in addition to several sub-targets that focus on specific, critical areas of road safety. Given that responsibility for road safety is shared among several ministries and a variety of key public and private non-governmental agencies in the province of Alberta, coordinating efforts to improve road safety is very challenging. Major gains in collision reduction will result from a combination of focused safety improvements to the driving environment (*engineering*); targeted, focused and enhanced *enforcement* interventions, including an effective set of enforceable and appropriate traffic laws; and a combination of a variety of communication activities (Road User Education). Most of the targets in the TSP cannot be achieved without substantive behaviour change on the part of drivers, passengers and other road users. Experience and research has shown that a combination of enforcement, engineering and education is an effective, and in some cases, the best way to influence behaviour change.

Overall Target

- 30% reduction in number of people killed in traffic collisions.
- 30% reduction in number of people seriously injured in traffic collisions.

The Traffic Safety Action Plan for 2007 to 2010 identifies the activities to be undertaken in the short-term, over the next one to three years.

The purpose of the Traffic Safety Action Plan is:

- To ensure that all stakeholders work cooperatively to meet provincial targets.
- To identify intervention priorities, including legislative changes.
- To ensure that action items are focused on positive results.
- To identify implementation arrangements that maximizes effort.
- To identify the communication requirements at the provincial and local level.
- To establish other gaps and/or needs in education, surveillance, policy and infrastructure support (i.e. human, financial, information).
- To establish a performance evaluation program that can indicate progress towards the identified targets.

Four core traffic safety issues were identified as immediate priority issues:

- Occupant restraints
- Impaired driving
- Speed
- Intersections

Other topics that were identified as provincial priorities, specifically in relation to on-going education and enforcement activities include:

- Commercial vehicles
- Back to school
- Pedestrians
- Distracted driving
- Motorcycles
- Young drivers

Embedded within the plan are the principles of community mobilization.

Community Mobilization Strategy

The Community Mobilization Strategy is intended to empower the community, increase or facilitate community ownership, strengthen community action and coordination, and ensure healthy and safe environments. To this end, the Strategy will:

- Encourage and facilitate the development and implementation of sustainable community-led initiatives to meet provincial targets;
- Foster coordination of traffic safety initiatives undertaken by other stakeholders, such as the law enforcement community, engineers, health, volunteers and a variety of community groups;
- Involve Aboriginal communities (First Nations and Métis) with the goal of strengthening community action and coordination;
- Educate community residents and road users about the importance of traffic safety issues;
- Identify and support existing partnerships that have been created in support of traffic safety initiatives;

- Develop and nurture further partnerships that have been created in support of traffic safety initiatives;
- Develop and nurture partnerships with schools, colleges, universities, health, and other organizations in the undertaking of traffic safety initiatives; and
- Include industry sectors as partners in traffic safety.

The Traffic Safety Action Plan for 2007 to 2010 identified the following actions within the community mobilization area:

- Create a comprehensive Community Mobilization Strategy.
- Implement community mobilization strategies within Alberta.
- Coordinate the development and alignment of regional traffic safety action plans with the Alberta Traffic Safety Action Plan.
- Identify regional traffic safety stakeholders.
- Evaluate community-based traffic safety initiatives and programs.

Regional Traffic Safety Coordinators (RTSCs)

The Traffic Safety Action Plan identified the establishment of Regional Traffic Safety Coordinators (RTSCs) as an important step in mobilizing communities. In total, 16 RTSCs positions will be established including 11 RTSCs placed in 9 geographic regions and 5 RTSCs in Aboriginal communities. The RTSCs will coordinate local traffic safety action and support traffic safety networks at the community level.

Aboriginal Communities

Within Aboriginal communities, the RTSCs will implement targeted strategies to reduce rates of traffic collisions, injuries and fatalities among Aboriginal people. This will be done in consultation with leaders and elders in Aboriginal communities. The Office of Traffic Safety and RTSCs will establish and maintain regular meetings with key contacts from Urban Aboriginal Coalitions, Métis Nation, Métis settlements, First Nations, and International, Intergovernmental and Aboriginal Relations

2. Developing the Aboriginal Traffic Safety Plan

In December 2008 and February 2009, Alberta's six RTSCs working specifically in Aboriginal communities and related stakeholders gathered to develop a plan for mobilizing Aboriginal communities to address traffic safety issues.

This document summarizes the discussion at the December 18, 2008 and February 5, 2009 meetings.

Presentations

The morning of December 18, 2008 featured three presentations which ensured a shared understanding of the issue and some history about Aboriginal traffic safety efforts in Alberta.

Honouring Our Spirit and Breaking Point – Ms. Louise Knox, MADD Canada

Louise Knox provided an overview of MADD Canada's resources for Aboriginal communities entitled *Honouring Our Spirit and Breaking Point*.

Honouring Our Spirit is a MADD Canada victim services outreach program for First Nations and Métis victims of impaired driving. The program was developed in consultation with First Nations and Métis organizations across Alberta to be culturally sensitive and meet the specific needs of their communities.

The goal for this program is for MADD Canada to become a stronger support system to First Nations and Métis people who require impaired driving victim services by making them more aware of the victim services that MADD Canada offers and helping them feel comfortable asking for any help that might be needed.

Honouring Our Spirit includes a 23 minute video, Facilitator's Guide, poster and brochure.

Braking Point is a classroom educational tool created by MADD Canada that targets and portrays 14 to 18 year-olds who use and abuse alcohol and marijuana. The educational package and accompanying DVD dramatize real situations of alcohol and marijuana use as well as the risks and consequences of heavy use and is available in English, French or Aboriginal versions.

Braking Point's objectives are to:

- Create awareness of the risks and dangers involved in drinking and marijuana use and impaired driving.
- Connect these risks to common settings and situations in which many teens find themselves.
- Help them understand there are alternatives to dangerous risks.
- Provide strategies, including abstinence, that help them practice those alternatives.
- Reduce the deaths and injuries caused by impaired driving.

Mobilizing Aboriginal Communities – Dr. Peter Rothe, Alberta Centre for Injury Control & Research

Peter Rothe presented his findings from years of research into traffic safety in Aboriginal communities and provided insights into some of the issues that may be unique to Aboriginal communities.

Aboriginal Traffic Safety Summit Report – Ms. Joyce Fersovitch, Alberta Centre for Injury Control & Research

Joyce Fersovitch presented some historical information about the Aboriginal Traffic Safety Summit that was held in 2003. The purpose of the Traffic Safety Summit was to bring together communities and stakeholders to consider how to promote traffic safety and save lives. Summit objectives were to share information and expertise and to develop a framework for action supportive of community-based initiatives.

Traffic safety priorities identified by summit participants were: increasing the use of seat belts; increasing the use of child safety seats; and reducing impaired (alcohol/substance abuse) driving.

An Aboriginal Traffic Safety Model was viewed as being community driven and consisting of five key elements including: awareness raising, education, community-based information, enforcement, and environment.

A number of recommendations were made by the summit participants. Some of the key recommendations were:

- To establish regular and sustained funding dedicated to the prevention of traffic related injuries.
- To support Alberta-wide mechanisms that assist communities directly by providing information, access to expertise and support to develop and implement projects.
- To develop an Alberta-wide social marketing initiative that would benefit and facilitate efforts at a community level.

Next steps identified at the summit included developing an Aboriginal traffic safety plan based on the outcomes of the summit.

Planning Considerations

The presentations helped the group identify a number of factors it would take into consideration when planning activities:

- Elders are important partners in any traffic safety activity. They are well-respected in the community and build the credibility of projects among residents. They also provide a great deal of knowledge about the community which supports effective planning.
- Activities should be based on evidence where it is available. It is important to make planning decisions based on available surveillance data, research and knowledge. This will provide a greater chance of success.
- Long-term interventions are important. The causes of collisions are complex and often rooted in historical issues. Traffic safety issues are not changed immediately by single, short initiatives. Efforts must be sustained over the long-term to be effective.
- Building resilience in communities is important. Resilience implies that in the face of trouble, a community is not only able to cope and to recover, but is also able to change to reflect different priorities that arise from the problem. Communities need to be able to respond to adversity in a healthy manner.
- People's long-held beliefs sometimes do not reflect current reality. For example, some people do not want to strap children into car seats because they do not believe that honors children appropriately and prefer to hold them in their arms. There may be cultural beliefs that need to be considered when planning interventions.
- It is important to respect diversity between communities. Not all Aboriginal communities share the same language, customs, traditions, and traffic safety issues and concerns. Therefore, not all communities will respond to traffic safety interventions in the same way.

- There are differing levels and types of literacy across communities. When producing written materials, it is important to ensure they are appropriate for the literacy level of the intended readers.

Priority Issues

The group discussed a number of potential priority traffic safety issues including:

- Appropriate road signage and signals
- All terrain vehicles
- Awareness of traffic collisions and the preventable nature of collisions and injuries
- Bicycle safety
- Commercial vehicle safety
- Distracted driving including cellphones, electronic devices and other distracting behaviours
- Drivers behaving appropriately around emergency vehicles
- Engineering and road design
- Impaired driving
- Intersection safety
- Licensing and Graduated Drivers Licensing to ensure all drivers have adequate skills
- Occupant restraints
- Pedestrian safety
- School bus safety
- Speed

Priority Issues

After completing a prioritization exercise, the participants clearly identified two primary priority issues on which to focus efforts:

- Impaired driving
- Occupant restraints

Activity Planning

At the completion of the first planning meeting, participants identified other people that have expertise or special knowledge in the priority issues to involve in the next phase of planning. These individuals were invited to the second planning meeting.

When the expanded group met on February 5, 2009, they began planning activities. The participants broke into two smaller groups to identify activities the RTSCs could do to facilitate action in the community on occupant restraints and impaired driving in each of the strategy areas identified in the Alberta Aboriginal Traffic Safety Summit Report:

- Education
- Community-based information
- Environment

- Awareness raising
- Enforcement

The groups also discussed possible local partners to enable these activities and support that may be required at a provincial level.

3. Aboriginal Traffic Safety Strategy

The RTSCs are significant players in and contributors to the ATSP. The purpose of the Aboriginal Traffic Safety Strategy is to outline how the RTSCs working in Aboriginal communities may choose to mobilize their communities in support of traffic safety, specifically in occupant restraints and impaired driving. The plan provides some structure and priorities to increase consistency and focus across the province, while still ensuring community priorities and flexibility.

A. Activities for All Traffic Safety Topics

This section outlines the activities that were recommended for both occupant restraints and impaired driving.

Education Activities

- Create educational materials relevant to Aboriginal communities.
- Collect community data.

Community-based Information Activities

- Collect personal stories to create messaging to help community members understand the extent of the problem.
- Develop relationships with local communications groups and media.
- Identify funding sources.

Awareness Raising Activities

- Use billboards, school curriculum, television and local newspapers and the Canadian Native Friendship newsletter to raise awareness.
- Offer presentations in the community, including schools, events, community groups, employers, etc.
- When encouraging new partners and sponsors to support awareness raising initiatives, focus on this work as an investment in the future.
- Work with CFCW and CFWE to raise awareness.

Enforcement Activities

- Gain support from Elders about enforcement activities.
- Consider the role that everyone plays in enforcement activities, including parents, teachers, grandparents, community.
- Include enforcement as partners and identify potential joint projects. Consider involving sheriffs, bylaw officers, RCMP, peace officers, municipal police.

Possible Local Partners

- Elders
- Grandparents
- Political leaders
- Spiritual leaders
- Band, tribal police
- Aboriginal Peoples Television Network (APTN)
- Education boards
- Educators
- Local schools and school councils
- Alberta Health Services
- Local justice
- Local media
- Local role models including elders and youth
- Local Transportation representatives

Provincial Support Required

- Background information including research about the issue, best practice guidelines, and current work in the area.
- Statistics from Office of Traffic Safety, RCMP, FNIHB and ACICR.
- Assistance with development of provincial educational and promotional materials including writing, design, production and distribution of materials.
- Assistance and support with the development of local resources.
- Education about policing structure in Alberta.
- Help at provincial office level to work with or contact provincial committees.
- Sharing success stories across Alberta.
- Create clearinghouse for Aboriginal resources.
- Education about governance and how decisions are made in Aboriginal communities.

B. Activities for Occupant Restraints

Education Activities

- Connect with the community to increase participation at the annual Alberta Occupant Restraint Program (AORP) roundtables and ensure issues are brought forward. Build a list of community contacts and resources.
- Identify trainers for the child safety seat technician training and facilitate the training in their community.
- Facilitate non-enforcement child safety seat clinics within the community to teach parents how to transport their children safely.

Community-based Information Activities

- Explore possible partnerships (for instance with industry, schools, health) to help get messages out, build a community team, and consider joint projects.
- Set up a local committee.

- Identify champions in the community.
- Organize a provincial summit to share information, resources, successes and future plans.

Environment Activities

- Provide the information on appropriate choices for child safety seats, safe vehicles.

Awareness Raising Activities

- During March, occupant restraint month, use the AORP materials to help spread the message in the local community.
- Attend local community events and set up information displays to promote awareness and importance of occupant restraints.

Enforcement Activities

- Explore options to offer Option 4 if not already offered in the community.

Possible Other Local Partners

- Alberta Occupant Restraint Program
- Emergency medical services
- Fire department
- Industry
- Public works
- Social services
- Victims Services

Provincial Support Required

- Information and resources from the Alberta Occupant Restraint Program.
- Links with industry and business.
- Roundtable meeting support (lunch, room rental, etc.)
- Training on occupant restraints use and proper inspection practices.

C. Impaired Driving

Education Activities

- Educate community about drivers education, licensing and GDL.
- Collect community data on impaired driving.
- Address education about impaired driving as a life-long activity.
- Utilize MADD Canada's *Honouring Our Spirit* video.
- Locate Aboriginal resources from other provinces, possibly through the Canadian Council of Motor Transport Administrators.
- Facilitate the development of skits and videos about impaired driving in partnership with local schools.

Community-based Information Activities

- Collect data from local sources including police, health, newspapers, television reports.

Environment Activities

- Address “safe” places where problems are known to exist but no one is tackling them, such as bars which are known to over-serve.
- Implement a Curb the Danger or similar program to encourage individuals to call police about suspected impaired drivers.
- Work with alcohol-serving establishments to discourage their patrons from driving while impaired; educate staff about serving alcohol, over-serving, etc.

Awareness Raising Activities

- Do presentations about impaired driving in the community.
- Develop resources for young people.

Possible Other Local Partners

- Alberta Alcohol and Drug Abuse Commission (Alberta Health Services)
- Local artists
- Mental health
- National Native Alcohol and Drug Abuse Program
- Recreation teams

Provincial Support Required

- Assist with curriculum development for educating about impaired driving to young people.
- Provide existing provincial impaired driving education resources.